// Applied Arts Scotland Shared Creative Modern Apprenticeship Pilot Programme 2015-2018
// Evaluation Report (EDITED)

Apprentice Hannah in Carla Edwards Jewellery studio.

Prepared by Helen Voce for Applied Arts Scotland (SCIO), April-December 2019

This is the edited version of the Evaluation Report, a full version is available on request.

Helen Voce would like to thank Applied Arts Scotland's Chair Carol Sinclair, staff at host organisations and the apprentices for their cooperation in the research and writing of this Evaluation Report. Helen Voce acknowledges Creative Scotland for funding Applied Arts Scotland to undertake this research and evaluation.

// Contents

// one //	Executive Summary		3
// two //	Report		
	// two // 1 //	Scope & Aims	5
	// two // 2 //	Research Methodology	5
	// two // 3 //	Format	6
// three //	Applied Arts Scotland SCIO		7
// four //	Shared Creative Modern Apprenticeship Pilot Programme		
	// four // 1 //	Summary	8
	// four // 2 //	Employer Context	9
	// four // 3 //	Tables of Apprentices	12
// five //	Summary Findings		
	// five // 1 //	Employer & Apprenticeship Project Manager	14
	// five // 2 //	Apprentices	20
	// five // 3 //	Host Organisations	23
// six //	Conclusion & Recommendations		
	// six // 1 //	Conclusion	34
	// six // 2 //	Recommendations	49

// one // Executive Summary

The objective of Applied Arts Scotland 's (AAS) Shared Creative Modern Apprenticeship Pilot Programme 2015-2018 was to understand the feasibility, appropriateness and impact of a contemporary, fit for purpose shared Modern Apprenticeship (MA) model for micro businesses and sole traders in the craft sector seeking to build capacity in their businesses and practices, and to understand an alternative pathway to education for young people into the sector. The Pilot Programme focused specifically on trialing delivery of newly introduced Skills for Craft Business MA framework.

The Pilot Programme built on AAS's research to further understand the craft sector's interest in apprenticeships to build capacity in the micro businesses and practices of sole traders' and as an alternative pathway to education for young people into the sector, plus barriers to establishing and running them in response to respondents in their 2014 Craft Sector Survey.

The Pilot Programme's outcomes were:

1. Recruited six modern apprentices aged 16-25 in Edinburgh, Glasgow, Dundee and Inverness
    - Three gained their MA Certificate of Completion one in Community Arts Management and two in Skills for Craft Business
    - Three left and did not complete their apprenticeships
2. Recruited 12 host organisations
    - four sole traders, three CICs, one SCIO and five private companies limited by guarantee
    - based in Glasgow, Edinburgh, Dundee and Inverness
3. Worked with three training providers
    - Fife College
    - City of Glasgow College
    - Dundee & Angus College
4. Worked with three MA frameworks and two sector skills councils:
    - Creative & Cultural Skills for the MAs in Skills for Craft Business at SCQF Level 7 and Community Arts Management at SCQF Level 6
    - Creative Skillset for the MA in Creative & Digital Media at SCQF Level 7
5. Secured a total of £47,300 from nine national and local organisations to fund AAS's research, administration, management and delivery of the Pilot Programme, and to subsidise apprentices' wages.

The Pilot Programme also demonstrated:

- In practice, the Skills for Craft Business MA is a good fit with craft micro businesses and sole traders in Scotland's craft sector with the combination of creative and business skills of particular importance, relevance and fit.
- The part-time nature of the shared MA model can flex to suit partner host organisations' work commitments, workloads and work calendars, services and seasonality and is therefore fit for purpose and appropriate for craft micro businesses and sole traders. Therefore, it can shape an apprenticeship structure responsive to the MA and units selected for study offering the apprentice variety and focus as required.
- The combination of the shared MA model and AAS as employer gave micro businesses and sole traders the confidence to take the risk to employ, many for the first time.
- Host organisations' experience of capacity building in their businesses was tangible and intangible:
    - Tangible - primarily for host organisations providing multiple services or with a focus on production of their own work or the work of others, in the form of increased production,

sales and income, established resources to support day-to-day running of the business, set up and running of physical spaces for production and online platforms for sales.
    - Intangible – via direct experience, gained perspective on where there is potential for additional capacity in their businesses and how this will inform their future development.
- Since hosting an apprentice, 50% of host organisations actively recruited staff and student placements into their micro businesses.
- Since completing their MAs, young people progressed to work (employed and freelance) and study in the creative industries.
- Via host organisations examples, young people saw their employment options could be shaped and informed by what they are passionate about or believe in by being given a chance to do something that they really enjoyed.
- AAS's activity is contributing to conversations about apprenticeships in the craft sector and the wider creative industries, including their potential to address current issues regarding skills retention and preservation of heritage practices, at government level and with UK wide bodies.

Interviews with AAS's Apprenticeship Project Manager Carol Sinclair, apprentices and host organisations consider delivery, opportunity, experience, impact, learning and next steps. Analysis of findings from the interviews evaluate the Pilot Programme's outcomes, outputs, successes and impact, and establishes learning and opportunities to apply to AAS's future delivery of a shared MA programme.

10 recommendations are made to support AAS's development of a strategic, systematic and sustainable approach to and infrastructure for delivery of the next phase of the shared MA programme in the craft sector with identified key partners and appropriate resources:

1. Focus on delivery of the Skills for Craft Business MA only
2. Actively partner training providers to recruit for the Skills for Craft Business MA, including improving their knowledge of the craft sector to provide context for delivery
3. Craft micro businesses and sole traders propose being partner host organisations of a MA
4. Secure HR support, specifically focussed and specialised
5. Manage, clearly articulate and agree all parties' expectations of the MA at the outset
6. Create a 'DRAFT Manual' as a shared Google / GitHub Doc and crowdsource content from AAS the employer, plus past and future host organisations
7. Host 'Build the Capacity of Your Craft Business' workshops to inform craft micro businesses and sole traders becoming host organisations in the future shared MA programme
8. Research variations of the shared MA model for delivery of the Skills for Craft Business MA in rural locations
9. Appoint an Apprenticeship Project Manager
10. Secure long-term incentive funding

Finally, the Evaluation Report compiles the beginnings of:

- An understanding of what is involved in craft micro businesses and sole traders hosting a shared apprentice.
- AAS's longer term aim to be a sector training body for skills and assessment to deliver the Skills for Craft Business MA framework, drawing on their network of professional makers, many with educational experience, with a view to providing an MA true to the craft sector and what it requires.
- Outline of the role of a to be appointed Apprenticeship Project Manager for the next phase of the shared MA programme.

// two // Report

// two // 1 // Scope & Aims

The scope of the Evaluation Report is to review Applied Arts Scotland 's Shared Creative Modern Apprenticeship Pilot Programme 2015-2018, whose objective was to understand the feasibility, appropriateness and impact of a contemporary, fit for purpose shared Modern Apprenticeship (MA) model appropriate for micro businesses and sole traders in the craft sector seeking to build capacity in their businesses and practices and to understand an alternative pathway to education for young people into the sector.

Findings of interviews with employer Applied Arts Scotland SCIO (AAS) via Apprenticeship Project Manager Carol Sinclair, host organisations and apprentices were gathered and analysed to:

1. Evaluate the Pilot Programme's outcomes and outputs
2. Evaluate the Pilot Programme's successes and impact
3. Establish learning to apply to future iterations of AAS's shared MA programme
4. Establish opportunities for improvement to apply to future iterations of AAS's shared MA programme
5. Understand what is involved in craft micro businesses and sole traders hosting a shared apprentice
6. Inform a set of recommendations for taking forward a shared MA model in the craft sector, adaptable to the wider creative industries in Scotland
7. Inform the content and format of practical resources to support delivery of shared MAs, and to introduce the model to the wider creative industries as an option for their consideration
8. Inform production of a dissemination event for Creative Scotland staff to encourage taking forward research into apprenticeships and shared MAs in the wider creative industries
9. Support AAS's longer term aim to be a sector training body for skills and assessment

The Evaluation Report does not draw comparisons to other apprenticeship programmes, whether shared or otherwise, and unless stated, does not consider:

- The Pilot Programme's budget and financial operations
- Views of the training providers
- Views of stakeholders, funders, etc.

The Evaluation Report is for:

- AAS's internal reference
- AAS's review of the Pilot Programme to inform the next phase of the shared MA programme
- sharing with current and future host organisations, apprentices, stakeholders and funders
- conversations with the wider creative industries about apprenticeship models to support young people into working in the sector

The aims of the Evaluation Report are to:

- Discover what worked and didn't work
- Discover what was successful and challenging
- Where and how it made a difference
- What do all involved know now that they didn't know at the beginning
- Establish what can be improved
- Inform what we can share with others in the creative industries to support future apprenticeship and shared MA opportunities

// two // 2// Research Methodology

Research for the Evaluation Report was in two stages:

1. Desk based research and review of existing AAS documents and materials.

2. Individual, face-to-face interviews with AAS the employer and Apprenticeship Project Manager, host organisations and apprentices, conducted at their studios / cafes / via Skype, April-November 2019.

Of the interviews:

- Two of six apprentices (**// four // 3 // Tables of Apprentices**, pages 12-13) consented to face-to-face interviews; four did not reply to initial email / telephone invitations.
- 10 of the 12 host organisations, including AAS, consented to face-to-face interviews; two responded to initial invitations, however schedules did not align for interviews.
- Unfortunately, the recorded Skype interview with Highland Print Studio froze half way through so data from this host organisation is limited.

Findings were analysed and written up in October/November 2019 and presented to AAS in December 2019.

For transparency, Helen Voce has been an Advisor to AAS since 2013 and facilitated the *Work Based Learning in the Creative Industries* event, a partnership between AAS, Creative Scotland and Skills Development Scotland, at Codebase Stirling, 02.10.2018.

// two // 3 // Format

Firstly, the Evaluation Report profiles:

- AAS and the genesis of the Pilot Programme **(// three //**, page 7).
- The Shared Creative Modern Apprenticeship Pilot Programme in the context of AAS's reasons and motivations for the work, role and responsibilities, recruitment process, finances required and funding accessed, plus training providers worked with and details of the apprentices (**// four //**, pages 8-13)
- The host organisations.

In **// five //** (pages 14-33), summary findings from interviews with the employer and Apprenticeship Project Manager (**// five // 1 //**, pages 14-19), apprentices (**// five // 2 //**, pages 20-22) and host organisations (**// five // 3 //**, pages 23-33) are presented. All summary findings consider experience, impact, learning and next steps, with the addition of delivery for the employer and Apprenticeship Project Manager and opportunity for apprentices and host organisations.

The conclusion analyses the gathered findings to review the Pilot Programme and makes recommendations for AAS taking forward a shared MA programme (**// six //** pages 34-52).

// three // Applied Arts Scotland SCIO

Applied Arts Scotland SCIO (AAS) is a membership organisation run by makers for makers giving an authentic, collective and professional voice for the sector and delivering tangible benefits. They nurture the creative heart and soul of making practice by:

- Connecting the craft community
- Engaging the community through events, projects and discussions
- Building skills through access to peer experience and skills swop at a professional level
- Influencing, lobbying and ensuring the voice of makers is heard
- Encouraging self-sufficiency and confidence in the sector

Scottish -Thai Craft & Design Exchange 2016, Phrae with British Council's Crafting Futures

Established in 1990, AAS originally operated as an unincorporated association, registering as a charity in May 1994, to support the professional development of craftspeople, designers and applied artists living and working in Scotland. Supported by makers, craftspeople, designer makers and their supporters, the organisation has taken various legal structures and involved a number of passionate individuals, mostly in a voluntary capacity. AAS became a Scottish Charitable Incorporated Organisation (SCIO) in 2016 and is run by a voluntary Board of 10 makers representative of disciplines, stage of practice and geography.

As a membership organisation, AAS provide professional and creative development opportunities for craftspeople, makers and designer makers in Scotland, including workshops and training, plus international exchange and residency opportunities as a UK partner in the British Council's Crafting Futures network.

AAS believe a thriving Scottish craft sector requires:

- the development, sharing and passing on of specialist skills, both creative and business
- the building of capacity within the sector's micro businesses and sole traders which make up the majority of the sector
- the nurturing of new talent

This belief, supported by sector research, informed AAS's delivery of the Creative Shared Modern Apprentice Pilot Programme.

// four // Shared Creative Modern Apprenticeship Pilot Programme

// four // 1 // Summary

The objective of the Shared Creative Modern Apprenticeship Pilot Programme was to understand the feasibility, appropriateness and impact of a contemporary, fit for purpose shared MA model for micro businesses and sole traders in the craft sector seeking to build capacity in their businesses and practices and to understand an alternative pathway to education for young people into the sector.

AAS's inquiry into apprenticeships was driven by the Board's response to their 2014 Craft Sector Survey in which respondents expressed an interest in apprenticeships and internships to build capacity in the micro businesses and sole traders that make up the craft sector and as an alternative pathway to education for young people into the sector. Exploring standard Modern Apprenticeship (MA) models in Scotland, AAS developed a specific interest in a shared model to deliver MA frameworks. In January 2015, Creative Scotland funded research by then AAS Chair Inge Panneels to further understand the sector's interest in apprenticeships and barriers to establishing and running them, AAS established its first shared MA. Since, the Pilot Programme has:

1. Recruited six modern apprentices aged 16-25 in Edinburgh, Glasgow, Dundee and Inverness
    - Three gained their MA Certificate of Completion one in Community Arts Management and two in Skills for Craft Business
    - Three left and did not complete their apprenticeships
2. Recruited 12 host organisations
    - Four sole traders, three CICs, one SCIO and five private companies limited by guarantee
    - Based in Glasgow, Edinburgh, Dundee and Inverness
3. Worked with three training providers
    - Fife College
    - City of Glasgow College
    - Dundee & Angus College
4. Worked with three MA frameworks and two sector skills councils:
    - Creative & Cultural Skills for the MAs in Skills for Craft Business at SCQF Level 7 and Community Arts Management at SCQF Level 6
    - Creative Skillset for the MA in Creative & Digital Media at SCQF Level 7

Details of the six MAs, including locations and timings, are provided in **// four // 3 // Tables of Apprentices** (pages 12-13).

AAS secured a total of £47,300 from and worked with nine national and local organisations for two distinct elements of the Pilot Programme:

1. AAS's research, administration, management and delivery:
    - Creative Scotland - £5,800
    - Creative & Cultural Skills Creative Employers Incentives Grant - £6,000
    - Skills Development Scotland (SDS) - £10,000
    - Highlands & Islands Enterprise (HIE) - £5,000
2. Subsidy of apprentices' wages:
    - Scotland's Employer Recruitment Incentive (SERI), now known as the 'No-One Left Behind Employability Funding Stream', via City of Edinburgh Council, Glasgow City Council, Dundee City Council and Highland Council - £20,500 (equal to £4,000 for four apprentices and £4,500 for one apprentice)
    - SDS's Employability Fund via Barnardo's – *funding paid directly to apprentice*

As the employer and Apprenticeship Project Manager, AAS's role and responsibilities were to:

- Liaise with the training provider to establish MA opportunities and to keep up to date with the apprentice's progression on their MA

- Recruit host organisations
- Define MA job opportunities with host organisations
- Recruit and appoint apprentices
- Contract host organisations
- Contract, employ and pay apprentices
- Liaise with and support host organisations
- Liaise with and support apprentices
- Liaise with, negotiate, secure and receive funds from SDS
- Liaise with, negotiate, secure and receive funds from national and local partner organisations

Finally, the Pilot Programme warranted a visit from Ms Fiona Hyslop MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Tourism and External Affairs during Apprenticeship Week 2016. The Cabinet Secretary visited apprentice Hannah Campbell at host organisation's Mairi Brown's textile studio in Edinburgh to find out about the shared MA model in the creative industries.

// four // 2 // Employer Context

Information from Apprenticeship Project Manager Carol Sinclair's interview expands on the above summary, and provides context of AAS's reasons and motivations for undertaking the Pilot Programme, their role and responsibilities, recruitment of host organisations and apprentices, finances required and funding secured, plus training providers worked with.

Reasons & Motivations

Building on AAS's research in response to the 2014 Craft Sector Survey and subsequent, and awareness of and involvement in continued and ongoing conversations about the popularity of apprenticeships in the creative industries but diminishing status in the craft sector, for Carol; *'…it became clear that part-time apprenticeships were something of real interest, because they were one of the only possibilities for people who are working on their own. It was too much to take someone on full-time.'*

Research proposed positive exploration of a contemporary, fit for purpose apprenticeship model for micro businesses and sole traders in the craft sector away from the *'… apocryphal tale almost of what apprenticeships have been in the past. And that notion of how they… blacksmiths or… other quite traditional crafts, had always had an apprenticeship methodology for training up new people.'* A frustratingly minimal amount of information about part-time apprenticeships was available and therefore little knowledge of how they worked and were funded. CCSkills made Carol aware of the practical application of a shared MA model in Scotland's traditional music industry where *'… one particular organisation had taken the lead as the employer and had then sent the apprentice out to several other music organisations to get a breadth of experience.'* Carol was attracted to the shared model to enable part-time employment of an apprentice as *'Simply… it seemed the only option. It seemed the only way that certain types of business could realistically take on an apprentice.'*

Informing, and aligning with AAS's commencement of the Pilot Programme, were two concurrent CCSkills activities:

1. Carol's membership of an advisory group informing creation of a new Skills for Craft Business MA framework
2. Time limited availability of Creative Employers Incentives Grant of £6,000 from CCSkills, devolved from Creative Scotland funds to incentivise creative industry organisations to employ apprentices

For AAS, introduction of the to be approved Skills for Craft Business MA by CCSkills *'… meant that we almost had a structure that we could use. Because really up until that point, there wasn't a craft structure that could be used.'*

Role & Responsibilities

Only one employer is required in a shared MA model with the apprentice placed with a to be agreed number of partner host organisations for agreed time periods, maybe on rotation, within the year of their studies. As AAS led the Pilot Programme, Carol explained it *'… seemed very simply and straightforwardly our role…'* to act as the employer of the apprentices. As employer, AAS appointed Carol as Apprenticeship Project Manager which involved:

> *'…making the contact with the college, looking to get the apprentice signed up with whichever college it was going to be, we put the contracts together, we coordinated the recruitment process, we… handled all the practical parts of it. Even to the point of also offering… pastoral care… practical support to any of the employers that we were working with, making regular contact with the apprentice to make sure that everything was on track… I think broker is probably quite a good way of describing what we did.'*

The only exception to this was AAS's dual role of employer and host organisation with Holly Wesley's Community Arts Management MA where, the first in the Pilot Programme. Carol explained it was in AAS's interest to be a host organisation as well as *'…employer of a shared apprentice in order to see what it was like…'*

Recruitment of Host Organisations & Apprentices

Five apprentices had disabilities and disadvantages, including dyslexia and dyspraxia. They were eligible for and received SERI funding, available to young people aged 16-29 with disabilities and disadvantages, entering a new job or MA and working for a minimum of 16 hours, *'…it was only available to young people who were in a particular age group and who had particular needs. So, there was … a broad range of individual circumstances that… qualified the young person for the funding, but they were all… things that had been barriers to that young person… in their schooling… or their opportunities.'*

As a high percentage of professional craftspeople have dyslexia and dyspraxia (10% of the general population are believed to have dyslexia or dyspraxia, while this figure is believed to be up to 30% in the creative population) AAS and host organisations were motivated to support young people with learning difficulties and potentially associated barriers to employment with an opportunity to be welcomed into working in the craft sector. They believed young people were likely to be:

> *'…creative thinkers, but they've often gone through a schooling that hasn't really supported that particularly well. So, there are confidence issues. Sometimes mental health issues associated with that. And at least half of our makers that we worked with as the employers are themselves dyslexic. So, they had been very warmly, encouraging of taking young people into their world to show them how it's possible to make a living. To… share the hard-earned skills and knowledge they had gained about how to cope with those, kind of day-to-day challenges.'*

Carol continued *'…Mairi Brown, who is very open about her dyslexia, was really keen to share with someone who she could see was struggling a bit, and wanted to be able to build her confidence.'* Recruitment of these apprentices was mostly by referrals from local youth and employment networks, representatives of national organisations and Pilot Programme partners. Without eligibility criteria restrictions, the sixth apprentice was recruited via an open call optimising AAS's, host organisations' and funders' existing networks.

Host organisations were recruited through AAS's membership and networks, and drew on Carol's considerable knowledge and experience of working in Scotland's craft sector, *'There were… people that already had a relationship with Applied Arts, or that I knew from working… so I… asked people that I thought were of the right mindset...'* Informed by her knowledge of capacity building challenges faced by craft micro businesses and sole traders, Carol identified them as being at the right stage to host a MA if they:

- Were established

- Had a regularity to their working pattern
- Had or were seeking to build capacity
- Had some previous experience of employing staff or contracting freelancers
- Were keen to support a young person to gain skills or experience
- Sought a development opportunity

Finances & Funding

For AAS's research, administration, management and delivery of the Pilot Programme, an initial £5,000 grant from SDS covered their upfront research costs *'…of finding out what you need to do in order to make it possible…'* and expenses at the outset, *'Particularly things like the cost of processing wages, insurances, some of the travel costs for interviews, and a contribution towards the time for overall project management.'* Carol admits the grant did not cover all of AAS's time on the project, and it required additional voluntary time. A second £5,000 grant from SDS recognised AAS's initial work and enabled a second phase, along with a £5,000 grant from HIE and funding of £5,800 from Creative Scotland for evaluation and dissemination.

Apprentices' wages were subsidised with funding from local partner organisations, local authorities and enterprise agencies in areas the Pilot Programme was delivered:

- Scotland's Employer Recruitment Incentive (SERI), now known as the 'No-One Left Behind Employability Funding Stream', via City of Edinburgh Council, Glasgow City Council, Dundee City Council and Highland Council - £20,500 (equal to £4,000 for four apprentices and £4,500 for one apprentice)
- SDS's Employability Fund via Barnardo's – funding paid direct to the apprentice

Training Providers

AAS liaised with the training provider, which Carol explained reassured host organisations, *'…I took on that responsibility where I could. Particularly in the case of the two Inverness apprentices. I contacted the college very regularly to make sure that they understood the timeline we were working to. And to try and make sure that the assessment of the work was being done.'*

AAS worked with three training providers in the Pilot Programme. Carol described the working relationship with the first training provider, where Holly studied a Community Arts Management MA, as *'Glasgow College were great.'* Holly's and AAS's experiences with City of Glasgow College on the whole were positive, with Carol recalling the college taking a lead on *'…looking at the units, organising a timetable, being really clear about what was required.'* Although initially enthusiastic to continue as the training provider for the Skills for Craft Business MA and interested in developing the required model for its remote delivery and assessment in other areas of Scotland, City of Glasgow College withdrew at the last minute as AAS had recruited apprentices. With experience of remote delivery, Fife College became the training provider of the Skills for Craft Business MA, a framework they'd had previously considered but had not yet seen any demand.

Apprenticeships can start at any time as they are not subject to the academic year's timings. This presented an opportunity for AAS to align the MA schedule with host organisations' commercial work calendars. This approach worked for host organisations and apprentices, however, in practice Fife College's timetable was at odds with commercial calendars, and with the college's staff shortages through illness created practical problems for meeting assessment deadlines.

Recalling her time on the CCSkills advisory group to inform creation of the Skills for Craft Business MA, once the framework was operational, Carol positively reflected *'...the fit of the units to the job of work that was being done in the studio, was perfect.'*

Of the relationship with the third training provider Dundee & Angus College, where Jasmin studied a Creative & Digital Media MA, Carol explained they '*… were very supportive in terms of helping us recruit Jasmin…'* plus *'They were really helpful in setting up the employability fund…'* which provided Jasmin with financial help for a week's work experience prior to commencing the apprenticeship.

Glasgow

Apprentice	Modern Apprenticeship (MA) Framework	Training Provider	Host Organisations	Timing	Apprentice's Status on Application	Qualification	Apprentice's Current Status
Louise	MA SVQ 3 Skills for Craft Business at SCQF Level 7	Fife College	Vanilla Ink Jewellery School CIC - Scott McIntyre and Kate Pickering (Directors) Katie Lees Jewellery	15 January 2018 – 31 May 2018	Completed HNC in Art & Design at City of Glasgow College. Unemployed for two years and seeking a job relevant to her studies.	Left after 6 months and did not complete apprenticeship.	Currently unemployed, following short periods of work in an office and as a cleaner.

Inverness

Apprentice	Modern Apprenticeship (MA) Framework	Training Provider	Host Organisations	Timing	Apprentice's Status on Application	Qualification	Apprentice's Current Status
Corrina	MA SVQ 3 Skills for Craft Business at SCQF Level 7	Fife College	Highland Print Studio – Alison McMenemy (Director)	17 October 2017 – 13 October 2018	Unknown.	Submitted and gained MA Certificate of Completion.	Continued working at Highland Print Studio.
Cara	MA SVQ 3 Skills for Craft Business at SCQF Level 7	Fife College	Wild Gorse Studio – Julia Kirk Highland Print Studio – Alison McMenemy (Director)	17 October 2017 – 13 October 2018	Completed sixth year at Inverness Royal Academy. Working part-time assistant jobs.	Submitted and gained MA Certificate of Completion.	Studied an Art Foundation course and recently completed a BA.

Dundee

Apprentice	Modern Apprenticeship (MA) Framework	Training Provider	Host Organisations	Timing	Apprentice's Status on Application	Qualification	Apprentice's Current Status
Jasmin	MA SVQ 3 Creative & Digital Media at SCQF Level 7	Dundee & Angus College	Open Change – Mike Press & Hazel White (Directors) The Circle – Kirsty Thomson (Founder and CEO) Creative Dundee – Gillian Easson (Co-founding Director)	January - June 2017	Studying a Certificate in Care at Dundee & Angus College and volunteering at Tayside MS Therapy Centre.	Left after 6 months and did not complete apprenticeship.	Unknown.

Edinburgh

Apprentice	Modern Apprenticeship (MA) Framework	Training Provider	Host Organisations	Timing	Apprentice's Status on Application	Qualification	Apprentice's Current Status
Holly	MA SVQ 3 Community Arts Management at SCQF Level 6	City of Glasgow College	Applied Arts Scotland SCIO – Carol Sinclair (Chair) Kalopsia - Nina Falk & Adam Robertson (Directors) Creative Edinburgh – Janine Matheson (Executive Director)	January 2015 – January 2016	Travelling for a couple of months. Started own photography business in home town of Oban. Keen to move somewhere new to live and work in the creative industries.	Submitted and gained MA Certificate of Completion	Holly has established an independent bakery in Glasgow having worked in independent cafes following continued work at Creative Edinburgh, then Codebase Stirling and some independent digital and photography commissions.
Hannah	MA SVQ 3 Skills for Craft Business at SCQF Level 7	City of Glasgow College	Carla Edwards Jewellery Mairi Brown Stitched Textiles	6 October 2016 – 4 October 2017	School Leaver – completed six Highers at Linlithgow Academy. Participated in Impact Art's 'Gallery 37' Summer programme. Volunteered as Teaching Assistant at Torphichen Primary School.	Completer a 2-yeaer period of employment but did not complete apprenticeship qualification.	Believed to be working at TK Maxx, Edinburgh.

// five // Summary Findings

// five // 1 // Employer & Apprenticeship Project Manager

Delivery
AAS's and host organisations' partnerships with local youth and employment networks, representatives of national organisations and Pilot Programme partners:

- Optimised apprenticeship recruitment
- Was specifically effective in obtaining referrals for apprenticeships targeted at young people with disabilities and disadvantages
- Realised applications well suited to and eligible for the shared MA opportunities from individuals that partners had prior knowledge of and were able to advise of personal circumstances and additional support needs / adjustments in the workplace
- Supported alignment of partners' project timetables

On the whole, host organisations' knowledge of apprenticeships was minimal and limited to traditional 'master / apprentice' models in the craft sector and very structured, large-scale models in industries such as construction. As micro businesses and sole traders operate precariously in terms of finance and resources, they don't feel in a position financially, administratively or in terms of sufficient workload to offer and support a full-time apprenticeship. The combination of the shared MA model and AAS as employer attracted and informed their decisions to host apprentices and take the risk to employ.

As a high percentage of professional craftspeople have dyslexia and dyspraxia, AAS and host organisations were motivated to support young people with learning difficulties and potentially barriers to employment with an opportunity to be welcomed into working in the craft sector. They both valued the availability of SERI funding to subsidise apprentices' wages and support opportunities for individuals with disabilities and disadvantages.

An established membership organisation operating in local and national networks, AAS is well positioned to recruit host organisations, supported by Carol Sinclair's considerable knowledge and experience of working with micro businesses and sole traders in Scotland's craft sector. Micro businesses and sole traders were at the right stage to host a shared MA opportunity if they:

- Were established
- Had a regularity to their working pattern
- Had or were strategically seeking to build capacity
- Had some previous experience of employing staff or contracting freelancers
- Were keen to support a young person gain skills or experience
- Sought a development opportunity

Further, some micro businesses and sole traders were better placed to host apprentices in terms of their experience, availability of resources and workload through the studio.

Craft micro businesses' and sole traders' reasons for and interest in becoming host organisations aligned with AAS's objectives:

- To explore building capacity in their businesses and practices
- To offer a young person the opportunity to experience working in the creative industries
- An introduction to alternative pathways to education into the craft sector
- Simply to give back

The shared MA model proved attractive to micro businesses and sole traders for the following reasons:

- Management and Administration
  - AAS's administrative support via the Apprenticeship Project Manager
  - AAS's role as adviser, mediator and facilitator via the Apprenticeship Project Manager

    - Apprenticeship Project Manager's availability to support the apprentice if problems arose
- Financial
    - Shared cost of an apprentice's full-time wage with partner host organisations
    - Available funds to subsidise the apprentice's wages
- Employment and Workload
    - Part-time nature
    - Collectively, with partner host organisations the ability to offer enough full-time work to an apprentice for a year
- Partnership working
    - Knowing, trusting and able to talk openly and honestly with partner host organisations about how things are going and when challenges arise
    - Operating at the same scale and career stage as partner host organisations
    - Working and collaborating with local partner host organisations to share the risks of hosting an apprentice, particularly if it is for the first time
- Training and Education
    - Shared responsibility with host organisations to offer an apprentice a variety of experiences and training in creative skills in different organisations
    - The Skills for Craft Business MA offers the apprentice the opportunity to learn business and creative skills
    - Affiliation with a training provider and opportunity for the apprentice to gain a qualification
- Young People
    - Opportunity to offer young people exposure to and experience(s) of working in creative business(es) in different sectors, and an introduction to an alternative pathway to education into the creative industries
    - Funding prioritised people with disabilities and disadvantages

Host organisations were well positioned, experienced and confident to provide work based creative and business skills training for the apprentice, but were wary about taking responsibility for apprentices' formal training for their MA qualification.

As apprenticeships can start at any time and are not subject to the academic year's timings, AAS aligned the MA schedule with host organisations' commercial work calendars. Whilst opportunist and beneficial to host organisations and apprentices, in practice AAS experienced challenges working in this way with training providers.

AAS worked with three training providers. Operational aspects worked smoothly with training providers of the established MA frameworks. Challenges of working with Fife College on the Skills for Craft Business MA were time management, communication, relationship management and assessment, plus provision of support to apprentices. Apprenticeship Project Manager, Carol believes these issues contributed to the reasons three apprentices did not submit for their MA, as training providers:

- Did not maintain communication with apprentices to avoid their sidestepping of studies and assessments
- Following on from 1, did not sustain relationships with apprentices to support their work on required coursework to be submitted for their MA Certificate of Completion
- Were not forthcoming with support for apprentices, specifically those with learning difficulties, when needed, and were unclear about the form it took, it's availability and how to access it

Going forward, AAS require training providers' written reassurance and clarity from the outset of the availability of their support to and resources for apprentices, how it can be accessed and when.

The Pilot Programme focussed on the Skills for Craft Business MA. Due to delayed final approval of the MA framework by the SFC, AAS trialled delivery of two established MA frameworks using the

shared model which highlighted the particular importance, relevance and fit of the combination of creative and business skills to the craft sector. Apprentice Project Manager, Carol confirmed the Skills for Craft Business MA, which she informed CCSKills creation of, featured a strong fit of units to the practice and work of craft micro businesses and sole traders.

As an organisation managing multiple development projects in the craft sector nationally and internationally, with collective experience of working with micro businesses and sole traders in Scotland's craft sector, AAS were well positioned to be the employer and Apprenticeship Project Manager. Their role and responsibilities were to:

- Liaise with the training providers to establish MA opportunities and keep up to date with the apprentice's progression on their MA
- Recruit host organisations
- Define MA job opportunities with host organisations
- Recruit and appoint apprentices
- Contract host organisations
- Contract, employ and pay apprentices
- Liaise with and support host organisations
- Liaise with and support apprentices
- Liaise with, negotiate, secure and receive funds from SDS
- Liaise with, negotiate, secure and receive funds from national and local partner organisations

Delivery of the shared MA model benefitted from the employer and host organisations knowing each other and also if they and the apprentice were all based in the same location, as the Apprenticeship Project Manager was on hand and present in person to communicate and meet with them. Remote delivery adopted in Inverness due to the lack of resources to support frequent travel for face-to-face meetings with apprentices and host organisations, meant nuanced issues were not picked up on and monthly contact stated in apprentices' employment contracts was unrealistic. AAS will therefore review agreements with host organisations and employment contracts with apprentices to share the responsibility to observe, highlight and raise problems and importantly, to support the young person to develop independence through the work-based learning opportunity.

The Pilot Programme's partnership working approach, the majority being pre-existing relationships, plus the skills and experience of the Apprenticeship Project Manager, meant support between stakeholders and AAS, and AAS and host organisations was strong. However, focussed and specialised HR support is required by:

- Host organisations to avoid apprentices taking advantage of their support and generous offer of a workplace opportunity
- Host organisations to provide apprentices with additional support needs in the workplace
- AAS to provide apprentices with the required pastoral care

Going forward, sustained expert support from representatives of national and local organisations experienced in supporting young people in education, the workplace and skills development is critical to AAS's delivery of shared MAs for the craft sector. And to support the craft sector to see the value of diversifying their work force in terms of age and ability.

An important element to the next phase of AAS's shared MA programme is incorporation of SDS's employability fund for young peoples' trial employment periods with a host organisation to establish if the opportunity is appropriate and both parties can work together before formally committing to an apprenticeship. Carol believes this intervention would overcome some challenges experienced by host organisations, as the trial period would raise issues and concerns earlier on in the relationship. And if accompanied by focussed and specialised HR support, would improve chances of a successful apprenticeship outcome.

AAS secured a total of £47,300 from and worked with nine national and local partner organisations for two distinct elements of the Pilot Programme:

1. Research, administration, management and delivery:
    - Creative Scotland - £5,800
    - Creative & Cultural Skills Creative Employers Incentives Grant - £6,000
    - Skills Development Scotland (SDS) - £10,000
    - Highlands & Islands Enterprise (HIE) - £5,000
2. Subsidy of apprentices' wages:
    - Scotland's Employer Recruitment Incentive (SERI), now known as the 'No-One Left Behind Employability Funding Stream', via City of Edinburgh Council, Glasgow City Council, Dundee City Council and Highland Council - £20,500 (equivalent to £4,000 for four apprentices and £4,500 for one apprentice)
    - SDS's Employability Fund via Barnardo's – funding paid directly to the apprentice

The cost of an apprenticeship is relative to variables; location being most significant and apprentices' wages second. Location of host organisations and apprentices' travel between them and their home is the biggest challenge of the shared MA model. Time, transport methods and costs need to be considered, and will significantly impact delivery of shared MAs in rural areas where micro businesses and sole traders are dispersed across a large geography. Adhering to National Minimum Wage and National Living Wage rates, the low rate of apprentices' wages appealed to host organisations, especially as they were shared pro-rata of the part-time employment. Despite the apprentices' low wages justified by paying someone to learn on the job, AAS and some host organisations had moral issues about the low wage level.

Experience

AAS actively explored and evidenced the feasibility of and gained an understanding of the impact of a shared MA that is contemporary and fit for purpose model appropriate to the craft sector's micro businesses and sole traders. Further, AAS have realised additional value in the potential to transfer the shared MA model to other creative industries, specifically its sole traders, the prevalent legal entity in the sector. AAS have started to identify organisations and bodies similar to themselves in other creative industry disciplines who could assume the employer and Apprenticeship Project Manager role.

The most enjoyable aspect for Carol was seeing first-hand how much young people got from their apprenticeships, primarily increased confidence and acceptance, and the opportunity, via hosts' examples, to see their employment options could be shaped and informed by what they are passionate about or believe in by being given a chance to do something that they really enjoyed. Sustaining apprentices' confidence, ability and self-belief levels on an even keel or upward trajectory throughout their MAs was a challenge and requires human and financial resource going forward.

AAS experienced two further key challenges:

1. Lack of experience and knowledge of HR, skills, policies and procedures, specifically in their support of young people with disabilities and disadvantages. Carol believes access to this expertise within AAS would enable host organisations to overcome some challenges of hosting young people with additional support needs in the workplace and improve the chances of a successful apprenticeship outcome.
2. Limited resources, knowledge and skills to sustain contact and effectively manage relationships with training providers, and, associated with the HR challenges of employing young people with disabilities and disadvantages, to sustain contact with and motivate apprentices to apply themselves and be self-directed.

Impact

The Pilot Programme impacted in the two intended areas of building capacity in host organisations' businesses and demonstrating alternative pathways to education for young people into the craft sector. A direct result of Carol's significant work and determination as Apprenticeship Project

Manager, negotiating multiple partnerships, relationships and opportunities, and her professional experience, raised the topic of apprenticeships in the craft sector and the wider creative industries, including the retention of creative skills, at government level.

Host organisations experienced tangible impact in the form of increased production, sales and income, and intangible benefits in the form of direct experience of where there were opportunities to build capacity in their businesses. Further, the Pilot Programme actively contributed to conversations about apprenticeships and capacity building in the wider, Carol believes risk averse, craft sector. To evidence the tangible impact and benefits of capacity built in craft businesses who have hosted an apprentice, Carol will do an additional piece of in-depth research with Carla Edwards Jewellery to understand her financial gain and risk taken during the employment period of the apprentice.

AAS's trial of the shared Skills for Craft Business MA evidenced what is required to resource one of a number of possible alternative pathways to education for young people into the craft sector. In doing so, Carol, an experienced, knowledgeable professional, commented none of the paths are prominent and clearly articulated to young people, and this requires attention. Carol believes delivery of the Skills for Craft Business MA supporting apprentices to develop business as well as creative skills has the potential to equip young people with valuable skills transferable into the wider creative industries and beyond, for employment and self-employment opportunities.

Learning

AAS's learning from the Pilot Programme was at a macro operational, managerial and strategic level. Key areas of learning are that will inform development and implementation of the next phase of the programme are:

- Relevance and fit of the part-time nature of the shared MA model to micro businesses and sole traders in the craft sector
- Need for the support of staff with skills and experience of working with young people in education, the workplace and skills development
- Appropriate levels and sources of finance
- Continuous management of expectations of all involved throughout the apprenticeship

The combination of the shared MA model and AAS as employer attracted and informed micro businesses' and sole traders' decisions to host apprentices and to take the risk to employ, many for the first time. The part-time nature of the shared MA model meant it could flex to suit partner host organisations' work commitments, workloads and work calendars making it relevant and fit for purpose. Building on the trialled shared MA model, Carol would like to explore two further models to enable craft micro businesses and sole traders to maintain their production and income whilst offering a training opportunity for a young person:

1. A facilitated part-time apprenticeship in which an apprentice is employed part-time directly by two employers whilst studying their MA, supported by a facilitator from the sector, such as AAS
2. Full-time study and part-time employment in which an apprentice studies full-time and is employed part-time directly by one employer, providing the apprentice with more time to study outside of their employment

The sheer determination of the Apprenticeship Project Manager and their work across multiple partnerships is recognised as fundamental to delivery of the Pilot Programme and what it achieved, including navigation of complications, seeking clarity and overcoming challenges. The next phase of the shared MA programme needs the support of staff with skills and experience of working with young people in education, the workplace and skills development to support apprentices, host organisations and training providers, and to broker and sustain the long-term investment of multiple partners into an agreed apprenticeship strategy for the craft sector.

Also required for the next phase of the shared MA programme is a set of practical resources that draw on the employer's, apprentices' host organisations' experiences and knowledge to support host

organisations to overcome their concerns about the practicalities, legalities, discrimination and financial risks of hosting an apprentice. Resources would enhance AAS's trusted role as Apprenticeship Project Manager and relationship broker.

Securing a slate of small funds to subsidise apprentices' wages drained vital human resources. Incentive funds are required for the next phase of the shared MA programme, and can be maximised if aligned with long-term multiple partners working towards an agreed apprenticeship strategy for the craft sector. To achieve this across Scotland, local authorities and enterprise agencies who want MAs delivered in their region need to make funds available and accessible. These funds will not only support employment and retention of young people locally but sustain existing micro businesses and sole traders. Carol will continue her conversations with QEST about the fit of their Apprenticeships Award to part-time MAs for craft micro businesses and sole traders in Scotland.

Finally, Carol will investigate the possibility of AAS becoming a sector training body for skills and assessment, what would be involved and how it would be resourced to deliver a shared MA model appropriate for and true to the craft sector, that draws on AAS's network of professional makers, many with educational experience, with a view to the sector looking after the sector.

Next Steps

AAS's next step is to review the Evaluation Report's conclusion and recommendations to inform development of the next phase of the shared MA programme for Scotland's craft sector. AAS and SDS agree this next phase will build on experience, relationships and learning from the Pilot Programme to inform AAS taking a strategic, systematic and sustainable approach to delivery via an appropriate infrastructure, with identified key partners and appropriate resources. Objectives of the next phase can reach beyond capacity building and providing alternative pathways to education for young people into the craft sector, to address important, relevant and current issues in the craft sector of skills retention and preservation of heritage practices.

// five // 2 // Apprentices

The Pilot Programme:

- Recruited six modern apprentices aged 16-25 in Edinburgh, Glasgow, Dundee and Inverness
  - Three gained their MA Certificate of Completion
  - Three left and did not complete their apprenticeships
- Worked with three MA frameworks and two sector skills councils:
  - Creative & Cultural Skills for the MAs in Skills for Craft Business at SCQF Level 7 and Community Arts Management at SCQF Level 6
  - Creative Skillset for the MA in Creative & Digital Media at SCQF Level 7
- Received a visit from Ms Fiona Hyslop MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Tourism and External Affairs during Apprenticeship Week 2016.

Two apprentices consented to be interviewed - Holly Wesley and Louise Hitchon.

Opportunity

Apprentices knowledge of apprenticeships was minimal and limited to traditional 'master / apprentice' models in the craft sector and very structured, large-scale models in industries such as construction. Profile of the Skills for Craft Business MA needs to be increased amongst young people to build their awareness of their options to study and work in the craft sector, and bust the polarised myth of the availability of apprenticeships.

Whether school leavers, part-time workers, unemployed or freelancers, young people actively seek apprenticeships in the creative industries as a route to working in the creative industries. Apprentices were attracted to the shared MA for the following reasons:

- Job involved working with your hands
- Work was part-time
- Job paid a good wage for a part-time apprentice role
- Work with multiple creative organisations was more interesting than work with one and provided the opportunity to gain much more experience, learn new things, work in different situations and have variety of work through switching
- Opportunity encouraged applications from individuals with disabilities and disadvantages
- Potential to meet other creative practitioners and organisations that may feature in future practice / business

Going forward, the part-time nature of the shared MA to work with multiple host organisations should be retained to achieve a variety of experiences and opportunities, as should MAs targeted at individuals with disabilities and disadvantages.

Experience

Apprentices valued and enjoyed their apprenticeships as whole experiences, and specifically for the following reasons:

- Able to apply and develop existing skills
- Could meet people and learn from them
- Had a creative output
- Were respected by others for their work
- Job was interesting
- Opportunity to grow
- Provided and prepared them for multiple future opportunities

Apprentices experienced the following challenges:

- Overwhelmed by workload – amount, variety, lack of structure and timing
- Not enough time for college work

- Lack of contact with and support from training providers, specifically support with learning difficulties
- Requirement to do work they were unfamiliar with, unconfident and unsure of
- Expectation to work alone and be independent
- Not knowing exactly what the work was they were supposed to do

Apprentices balanced the following during their apprenticeships:

- Learning and development of creative and business skills with host organisations alongside college coursework
- Time outside employment to continue paid freelance work
- Generating income beyond their apprenticeship wage from additional employed and paid freelance work to meet their living costs

Apprentices recognised the apprenticeship wage reflected their experience of work-based learning. In one instance, the wage covered apprentices' living costs, in another it was topped up.

Apprentices felt supported by their host organisations for the following reasons:

- They were welcomed into a team
- Had opportunities to engage in live interesting projects and activity within and outwith the business relevant to their MA studies and interests
- Provided a safe and supportive environment to push themselves to try new things and learn new skills

For their studies, apprentices successfully accessed additional support for their creative and technical skills development online and in general via members of their host organisations' networks. Apprentices were unsuccessful in accessing support with their learning difficulties from training providers due to their lack of contact, and from external support agencies, due to the shared nature of apprentices' employment and complex processes to access funds for assessment and implementation of reasonable adjustments.

Louise's expectations of support for apprentices with disabilities and disadvantages were not met. At the time of applying Louise was optimistic as the apprenticeship opportunity actively sought applications from individuals with disabilities and disadvantages, which overcame her anxiety of disclosing her personal circumstances. Once employed however, the employer AAS and host organisation Vanilla Ink lacked experience and specialist knowledge to support her in her role and provide the additional support needs she required in the workplace due to her dyslexia and mental health.

Apprentices' experiences of training providers differed. Focussed on getting her MA Certificate of Completion to assist progress in her future career, Holly took initiative and was self-directed in her work-based learning and studies at City of Glasgow College. Holly's challenge was the selection of units she studied; she was unclear why she studied the selected units and that she could choose from more available options. Given the choice of units Holly believed she could have selected more appropriate ones to her work with host organisations and could have avoided forcing her work into the inappropriate, pre-selected units. Going forward, Holly recommended units are selected by the appointed apprentice with the employer and host organisations and review the choice regularly.

Details of Louise's engagement with her coursework and tutors at Fife College were vague beyond initial meetings with college representatives, choosing units to study and encouragement from Vanilla Ink to document her work in the studio in preparation for her coursework. Louise claimed she didn't know what she had to do and why she was doing things for her coursework and this took up a lot of her time. Louise claimed Fife College was very disorganised, which was compounded by her having three contacts at the training provider and unsure which one to go to, when and what for.

Apprentices' advance online research of their employer and host organisations informed their expectations of their apprenticeship and meant these were matched in practice, and in some instances for Holly were exceeded.

Impact
Apprentices believed they impacted their host organisations for the following reasons:

- Their work is still actively used
- They were offered additional and continued employment beyond the apprenticeship
- They fitted in with and enhanced the team
- They provided their first experience of employing a member of staff

Learning
Apprentices' learnt the following from their apprenticeships:

- Grown in confidence, specifically with talking to work colleagues and receiving praise from them
- Want to continue working in the creative industries / a creative job
- Their strengths and weaknesses
- They have additional support needs in the workplace, and experience difficulty working if these are not met
- They like working, and more importantly working with people
- Learning and creative thinking from their apprenticeship can be laterally applied to subsequent work whether within or outwith the creative industries
- To share their weaknesses / what they aren't capable of with employers sooner to explore alternatives
- Require a physical space to work in to avoid lone and independent working

Going forward, Holly recommended provision of a peer-to-peer support network of apprentices in which members can share experiences with and get to know others in similar situations.

Next Steps
Holly applied learning, skills, creative thinking, confidence and experience of working with others from her apprenticeship to her employment and freelance work subsequent to completion of her MA, which has been in the creative industries and laterally in the food industry.

Louise took time out after leaving her apprenticeship to recover from burn out. She has had two jobs, not in the creative industries, and left both for reasons similar to the apprenticeship. Louise is currently unemployed. Louise's key next step is to get an autism diagnosis which as a result of working at Vanilla Ink, specifically with Scott, she suspects she has and is why she experiences difficulty in the workplace.

// five // 3 // Host Organisations

12 host organisations took part in the Pilot Programme; four sole traders, three CICs, one SCIO and five private companies limited by guarantee, based in Glasgow, Edinburgh, Dundee and Inverness. In addition to AAS, nine host organisations consented to be interviewed – Carla Edwards Jewellery, Creative Dundee, Highland Print Studio, Kalopsia, Katie Lees Jewellery, Mairi Brown, Open Change, The Circle, Vanilla Ink Jewellery School CIC.

Opportunity

As with apprentices, host organisations' knowledge about apprenticeships was minimal and limited. A couple of host organisations had researched available apprenticeship options, including the traditional 'master / apprentice' model, the QEST Apprenticeship Awards and Adopt An Intern, as routes to employment. These models were unsuitable due to host organisations' size and scales of operation, specifically the requirement to offer full-time employment and the associated financial commitment and workload. However, there is some key knowledge and experience of apprenticeships in organisations with the potential to be harnessed and shared in the sector to support development of a shared MA model and others appropriate to the creative industries.

Host organisations knew each other well, or of each other through local creative industries networks making their agreement of apprenticeship structures of apprentices' placements, timing and rotation with each straight forward. Apprenticeship recruitment was a joint effort between AAS and partner host organisations; agreeing the job description, drafting the opportunity, promoting via their networks, local youth and employment networks to reach interested and eligible individuals, shortlisting applicants, interviewing and appointing the preferred candidate.

Nearly all host organisations commented the recruitment process was rushed due to a number of factors: securing available SERI funding to subsidise apprentices' wages; availability of local partners' funds; optimising timing of the opportunity within host organisations' work commitments, workloads and work calendars; and, public holidays. Host organisations believed the speed of recruitment impacted on partners' planning and preparation. In Dundee the recruitment process revealed host organisations' uneven expectations of the Creative & Digital Media MA role and required training. One of the three original partners withdrew after interviewing shortlisted candidates as it was apparent candidates' interests and the digital element of the role was focussed on digital support of activity rather than pure creative digital. This shift in focus would have directly impacted on the partner who withdrew as they would have been the sole provider of specialist digital skills training to the apprentice. Mismatched expectations and lack of definition of the term 'digital' in the job description clouded recruitment. Via Creative Dundee's and Open Change's established networks in Dundee a replacement third host organisation was swiftly recruited, which shifted the job description further.

Host organisations believe a longer recruitment period would enable partners to work better together in advance to prepare and plan for a MA and widen the reach of opportunities, specifically those targeted at individuals with disabilities and disadvantages, to appropriate and eligible young people.

Apprentices' ages ranged from 16 – 25. The youngest recruit Jasmin completed a week's work experience at Creative Dundee before turning 16 and able to leave school. Gillian believes pre-apprenticeship work experience could be integrated into the shared MA to aid recruitment via apprentices' experiencing potential workplaces, and both parties getting a sense of each other before entering into a formal apprenticeship commitment. Aged over 25, Louise commanded a higher wage and payment of the national living wage which host organisations initially had financial reservations about. However, this was outweighed by Louise's maturity, passion and enthusiasm for creativity, experience from her previous creative studies, the impression she made at interview and latterly her fit with host organisation's working environments.

The majority of host organisations had little to no experience of employing staff. Some had experience of contracting freelancers, hosting student placements, paid work placements and interns.

Host organisations providing multiple services or with a focus on production of their own work or the work of others actively sought to build capacity in their businesses. Others wanted to offer young people an opportunity to experience working in the creative industries and an introduction to alternative pathways to education into the craft sector, to simply give back or to diversify their work force in terms of age and ability. For most host organisations they wanted to achieve at least two.

With the aim of attending more trade fairs, Carla required robust, confident production in her business to fulfil initial and repeat orders from stockists, and reduce lead times. Mairi required tasks critical to the day-to-day running of her business to be completed that she wasn't getting around to. Mairi and Carla identified focussed tasks, activity and projects for Hannah that aligned with the units she studied, enabled her to learn business and creative skills and host organisations to build capacity in their businesses. The sole traders observed Hannah learnt and developed skills by repetition, when supervised and accompanied by clear instructions and if work was introduced incrementally. This approach enabled Hannah to progress steadily and build confidence. To increase capacity at Vanilla Ink, Scott required an apprentice he could skill up to do jewellery repairs, support clients' commissions and deliver basic level jewellery classes. Vanilla Ink also needed to build resilience in the team, to cover staff's and freelance workshop leaders' absences to provide unbroken service provision and avoid loss of business. At a time of transition Kalopsia's Directors Nina and Adam required general support with operations, administration, events, setting up the office and manufacturing space and with preparation for and launch of a crowdfunding campaign.

Five apprentices worked for host organisations in different craft disciplines or different business types in the creative industries. In this instance, host organisations agreed an apprenticeship structure appropriate to their work commitments, workloads and work calendars, in which apprentices were placed for set time periods on rotation with each host. This structure provided apprentices with a variety of work and experience, and if well planned the opportunity to be placed with a host organisation at a particularly busy or interesting time to support their workload and the apprentice's learning. Again, advance planning of apprenticeship structures could optimise the timing, duration and rotation of apprentices' placements with host organisations and the units they study. Within these apprenticeship structures, some host organisations practised an adhoc 'borrowing' of apprentices when they either didn't have enough work to offer or had too much. In Edinburgh, borrowing worked for all concerned as Kalopsia and Creative Edinburgh optimised Holly's time with them when AAS didn't have enough work, plus Holly was able to transition well between businesses. However, in Dundee, the apprentice took advantage of being 'borrowed' and played host organisations off against each other.

In the sixth apprenticeship, Vanilla Ink and Katie Lees Jewellery both in the jewellery industry, agreed an apprenticeship structure that suited their work, services, seasonality and optimised work-based training and skilling up of the apprentice. For the first nine-months Louise would be placed at Vanilla Ink to develop business skills and jewellery skills from Kate and Scott respectively, with the latter training the apprentice to an appropriate skill level to be placed for the final three-months at Katie Lees' studio to fulfil orders and commissions in the run up to Christmas, Katie's busiest business period. Vanilla Ink's ethos as a jewellery studio and school is to educate, inspire and empower the jewellery industry. They'd contemplated how to train the next generation of jewellers to feed the jewellery industry, so, the shared MA was a natural fit for them. Vanilla Ink were not concerned about an apprentice setting up their own practice after completing an MA with them, as they wouldn't be in direct competition, indeed, Vanilla Ink feel well positioned to host apprentices who will go on to work in the wider jewellery industry.

In line with Carol's profile of businesses being at the right stage to host a shared MA (page 10-11), The Circle's experiences confirm business start-ups are not conducive to hosting apprentices. Further, in the case of Open Change, businesses in the creative industries providing untraditional services relative to creativity and digital taught within the school curriculum, require further interrogation to consider the skills required and type of work to be done in a shared MA from the young person's perspective to ensure it reflects the job and attracts appropriate candidates.

Experience

In addition to participating in the Pilot Programme with a number of other creative businesses in Scotland and, for sole traders, having regular company in their studio, host organisations valued and enjoyed hosting apprentices for the following reasons:

- Gained perspective on their business:
  - Opportunity to step outside of the business and look in rather than being constantly caught up in it
  - Learnt what needed to support operations and what would do differently in the future when employing apprentices and hosting student placements
  - Understood some of the not immediately apparent skills needed in the businesses
- Apprentices:
  - Fresh perspective on the work and who we do it for
  - Personality, character, confidence and professionalism
  - Application of natural creative talent to the role and ability to hit the ground running
  - Hunger to learn and the ability to pass skills on
  - Fit with team and working cultures and development in response to this
  - Development of confidence in hand skills and ability to work more independently
  - Interest in and validation of work

Host organisations whose apprentices submitted and gained their MA Certificate of Completion experienced the following challenges, predominantly with roles and responsibilities, communication and administration:

- Communication between all parties, especially as this was a new way of working, particularly with training providers when navigating and clarifying roles and responsibilities
- Training providers' performance and professionalism
- Resolution of financial administration of apprentices' travel expenses
- Ensuring the apprentice had a balanced experience and was getting enough out of it

Highland Print Studio had expected AAS as the Apprenticeship Project Manager to be more active in monitoring activity with the training provider and deal with issues promptly as they arose.

Host organisations whose apprentices left and did not complete their apprenticeships experienced the following challenges predominantly associated with apprentices' personal circumstances and manifested in their absenteeism:

Training Provider:

- Delayed final approval and implementation of the Skills for Craft Business MA directly impacting on the one-year delayed start to the apprenticeship, indirectly impacting financially on host organisations paying a second year of wages and the apprentice leaving employment due to their mental health and not completing their apprenticeship

Apprentices:

- Knowing when too much work is too much for an apprentice
- Having enough work across a range of supervision levels
- Sustaining a workload throughout an apprenticeship for an apprentice with limited skills required for the work
- Punctuality and unreliability, and their lack of awareness of its impact on host organisations' work
- Unexplained and increased frequency of absences connected to mental health issues
- Masking, avoiding and not being open about what they struggled with, found difficult, weren't getting to, caused anxiety, proved pressurised, became too much
- Took advantage of the opportunity having an employer and multiple host organisations and played them off against each other

Support:

- Lack of HR experience, skills and training to support apprentices with their mental health in the workplace, defaulting to drawing on personal circumstances
- Acknowledging a duty of care for apprentices and concern for their personal safety, navigation of the employer / employee relationship so as not to cross boundaries
- Non-disclosure of apprentices' personal circumstances, specifically their mental health, to enable provision of additional support or to inform necessary adjustments

Most partner host organisations had prior professional relationships that informed their working together effectively to offer, manage and support each other with delivery of the shared MAs. Differences and similarities in their size, scale of operation, seasonality and type of work provided a variety of experiences for apprentices. It also meant if partners had too much work they could approach the partner the apprentice was currently placed with and ask to 'borrow' them; this resulted in positive and negative experiences.

As independent sole traders, Mairi and Carla had a positive partnership due to their long-standing professional and personal knowledge of each other's practices, initially renting studios in the same venue and importantly advance planning of the apprenticeship structure relevant to the apprentice's studies and differences in their businesses; Carla's studio more production focussed and her work calendar centred on sales opportunities, and Mairi's studio producing to commission with a desire to establish online selling. Mairi and Carla acted as sounding boards for each other, discussed were things were going, identified solutions and agreed when to seek support from AAS.

Symbiosis was evident in Kalopsia's and Creative Edinburgh's partnership, specifically when Holly worked on events. In this instance 'borrowing' the apprentice worked as Kalopsia and Creative Edinburgh optimised Holly's time with them when AAS didn't have enough work. Plus, Nina and Adam witnessed Holly's ability to transition well between businesses, to transfer and use skills between host organisations and understand the importance of this practice.

In Dundee, Hazel recognised the importance of host organisations carving out collective time to plan delivery of the apprenticeship which due to Jasmin's absenteeism and subsequently leaving they didn't get into a regular routine of doing. In addition, Kirsty identified the need for focussed communication between host organisations to support the apprentice, adding self-starting leaders of fast paced, agile, small creative organisations need to recognise apprentices may not be of that mould.

Time was the primary element host organisations balanced in the MAs; the timing and duration of apprentices' placement with each host and the rotation, the time apprentices spent on specific projects / activities / tasks, and the time hosts spent training apprentices. Related was workload. Host organisations had to balance the amount of work and at what skill and supervision levels they could delegate to apprentices to enable their learning and development of skills and experience, whilst building capacity in the organisations. For Katie, balancing workload was a planning activity that informed setting the apprentice's objectives. For Kaolpsia it was critical to continuously ensure Holly had a balanced workload that enabled her to utilise her existing skills and learn new ones within Kalopsia's day-to-day operations and not let this be skewed by being reactive. Despite Mairi's considerable scheduling of Hannah's workload when in her studio, she described the need to be fluid when balancing the apprentice's time and workload due to Hannah's punctuality and absenteeism.

Due to Jasmin's short period of employment, her placement at Open Change didn't officially get started. Rather they *'borrowed'* Jasmin to support spikes in their workload. Based on this limited experience, Hazel proposed an alternative apprenticeship structure where apprentices are placed on a weekly rotation with host organisations, allowing the apprentice to bring their learning from one organisation to the next and to give each host a regular breather and time to accumulate, plan and prepare work for the apprentice the next time they are placed with them. In addition, from her experiences of working with young people since hosting Jasmin, Kirsty at The Circle suggested, prior to apprentices' getting started on tasks and activity, a concentrated introductory period would

support their transition from education to the workplace, development of formative skills and an opportunity for all to get to know each other.

Host organisations were able to effectively resource and manage with ease provision of specialist equipment, furniture and space for apprentices. At Kalopsia, introduction of a third member of staff to their husband and wife team impacted on their need to reconsider their physical space to accommodate another member of staff from what they retrospectively recognise was quite intimate.

Apart from the support of SERI funding that enabled host organisations to take financial risks, and their support of each other, host organisations accessed support from two the Apprenticeship Project Manager and external support agencies.

In her role as Apprenticeship Project Manager, Carol liaised with and supported apprentices, host organisations and training providers, through regular contact. Host organisations knew they could contact her if things arose or there was a problem.

Two host organisations engaged with external support agencies: Mairi and Carla with Enable, a charity working to make life better for people who have a learning disability and their families, and Vanilla Ink and Katie Lees via Louise with Access to Work. Both found the organisations knowledgeable, with Carla and Mairi achieving positive outcomes. Enable initially provided Hannah with personal safety equipment and a chair for use in hosts' studios, plus travel passes. When Hannah stopped attending work, at Mairi and Carla's request, an Enable representative attended a meeting with Hannah and the hosts to see if they could do anything to improve conditions for Hannah to come into work. Hannah ceased all contact shortly after.

Louise attempted to access disability support with her dyslexia from the training provider and computing / equipment via Access to Work. Taking responsibility for leading and administering all avenues of support, and repeatedly assuring Vanilla Ink she was on top of things, it became apparent Louise was frustrated with communications with potential supporters and became overwhelmed. Due to slow and adhoc replies from the training provider Louise was unsuccessful in accessing disability support. Access to Work provided Optivisors for Louise's use in the studio, but nothing else they promised. Kate at Vanilla Ink believes it was AAS's role to support apprentices' communications with external support agencies, benefit agencies and training providers.

Echoing Holly's recommendation in **Learning** (**// five // 2 // Apprentices**, page 22), Kirsty at The Circle identified support in the form of a peer-to-peer network of apprentices working and studying in similar situations, as valuable to future phases of the shared MA programme.

Host organisations did not access resources during the Pilot Programme. Going forward, Vanilla Ink and Open Change felt it was difficult to define resources host organisations required or would be relevant until the apprentice was in post. Kalopsia offered practical suggestions:

- A shared calendar featuring the apprenticeship structure detailing the timing and duration of when the apprentice is placed with each host organisation and the rotation, the MA units (focus, learning outcomes and topics of enquiry) studied and when, and host organisations' peak activity to enable partners' unified operations and management of the apprenticeship and communications between host organisations.
- A shared budget of the apprentice's wages, travel expenses, etc. that the employer and host organisations can access to plan and track combined and proportional expenditure.

All host organisations experienced difficult relationships with training providers, which some acknowledged were exasperated by apprentices' disinterest in or lack of initiative to be active in their formal studies and work-based learning. Host organisations struggled to:

- Understand the parameters of their input to the apprentices' formal MA studies
- Penetrate the college system and MA framework, particularly the newly introduced Skills for Craft Business MA

- Understand the schedule of apprentices' studies to plan and tailor work accordingly, ensuring it was relevant and timely

Kalopsia had the best experience of working with a training provider, which was supported by Holly taking initiative and a self-directed attitude plus their regular, informal check-ins with Holly about her studies. Kalopsia's check ins enabled them to understand if Holly's work with them supported her studies, and could adjust accordingly to ensure Holly optimised her work and studies.

Jasmin's poor attendance of work carried through to her attendance of college. As a school leaver, Gillian at Creative Dundee believed the college environment wasn't fit for purpose for Jasmin as it was too close to what she had left behind and reinforced the message she had no qualifications. Due to the short duration of Jasmin's employment, Hazel was unclear about the whole MA framework, its units and their connection to work with host organisations. If Jasmin had been with Open Change longer, Hazel would have engaged more with the units and built a better understanding of their relevance to their work.

Withdrawal of City of Glasgow College as training provider during Hannah's Skills for Craft Business MA and subsequent training provider, Fife College's delayed implementation of the MA framework they were unfamiliar with resulted in a one-year delay to Hannah's apprenticeship. Once officially started, Mairi and Carla confirmed the selected units were a good fit with the experience and opportunity they could offer Hannah in their businesses. Despite Mairi and Carla planning Hannah's work with them and encouraging her to record the work she was doing for use in her coursework, as the apprenticeship progressed host organisations' requirement to input into Hannah's coursework and set time aside for this became unclear, despite brief meetings between Hannah and a representative of the training provider. Mairi and Carla had little to no access to Hannah's college work to support her with her studies due to her avoiding questions about how her coursework was progressing and making excuses to give the illusion all was okay. Whilst is was Hannah's responsibility to apply herself to her studies and seek support, both Mairi and Carla speculated whether she would have gained her MA Certificate of Completion without the year-long delay and the support of AAS as the employer, as issues would have become apparent earlier and dealt with sooner.

The illusion that everything was okay was a similar scenario for Vanilla Ink and Louise. From their initial meeting with the training provider, Kate recalled understanding what was expected of Louise from the units she selected, which Kate and Scott felt weren't the best fit with her work at Vanilla Ink. At a subsequent meeting with the training provider about Louise's struggles with and falling behind in her coursework, it became apparent to Kate and Scott that Louise hadn't been honest with them about her progression. This was despite Kate and Scott's encouragement of Louise to see the relevance of and to document her work at Vanilla Ink for her coursework.

Host organisations' expectations of hosting an apprentice versus the reality was on the whole commensurate. Host organisations whose apprentices left employment before completing their MAs reflected and speculated more about how they could have done things differently.

Katie's expectations were to highlight what running an independent business looked like, to be a mentor and support and encourage Louise to use and apply her talents; she didn't get to test these out. Vanilla Ink's expectations were to train someone to play a critical role in the business. Describing Vanilla Ink as a very honest and open environment, their real-time approach was to open everything up to Louise which Kate reflected possibly contributed to Louise's reasons for leaving.

Informed by her knowledge of the more traditional 'master / apprentice' model, Carla's expectations were to support Hannah with learning specific skills to support production of her jewellery and to enable Hannah to make an object of her own choice and document this process. Carla's expectations followed through into reality. Mairi's expectation of the MA, a new employment model to her business, was about mutual benefit for host organisation and apprentice. For the majority of the apprenticeship this was the case.

If anything, Kalopsia believed they did less than they'd expected. As naturally worried people, Kalopsia continually asked themselves whether they had done everything or forgotten to do something.

In considering host organisations' expectations versus reality, Jasmin's Creative & Digital Media MA in Dundee stands out. From the withdrawal of one of the original partners shortly after interviews due to a shift in the digital element of the job and onus on them to provide specialist digital skills training to the apprentice, it is evident partner host organisations' expectations were mismatched and there was a lack of definition of the term 'digital' in the job description. This combined with the shift in focus of the MA during recruitment impacted on the role as the apprenticeship structure had too much flex for both host organisations and the apprentice to take advantage of it, and the revised mix of host organisations were lacking the necessary digital skills and expertise to train and support the apprentice and in turn enable them to support development of hosts' work and services. Gillian simply proposed the need for more time to discuss, negotiate and agree alignment of host originations' expectations, accompanied by sharing their relevant experiences and knowledge of previous employment of young people, especially given the parameters of recruiting individuals with disabilities and disadvantages. Hazel's expectation of the time required to manage and support Jasmin was very much exceeded in reality. Due to the short term of Jasmin's employment, Hazel queried whether her expectations of the apprentice to engage in and sustain delivery of the type of work Open Change offer, given how creative and digital is taught in the school curriculum, and Jasmin's interests and skill levels. Gillian hadn't expected to lead on the management of Jasmin at Creative Dundee and in turn across host organisations. In reality, this was a larger than expected time commitment. However, Gillian recognised Jasmin, and potentially school leavers of a similar age, require and will benefit in the long-term from a single point of contact. Having little time to set expectations, The Circle's reality of hosting Jasmin, was to find a balance of time and workload, and to get back to basics to ground the apprentice in the workplace which they may be experiencing for the first time.

Impact

Impact of the shared MAs on host organisations was in three areas:

1. Building capacity
2. Enhancement of organisation's team, service delivery and achievement of goals
3. Perspective on business / practice to inform development

As per the Pilot Programme's objective, host organisations reported hosting a shared MA enabled them to build capacity in their businesses. As expected, this was primarily for host organisations providing multiple services or with a focus on production of their own work or the work of others. Hannah increased productivity for both Carla and Mairi: respectively, increased production of jewellery and freed up time to plan and design work, and creation of an online retail platform and resources to fulfil clients' orders. In the short time Jasmin spent with Creative Dundee, Gillian reported her impact as basic, repetitive work for events. Holly's existing photography skills and ability to take imitative were timely in supporting Kalopsia's preparation for, launch and delivery of a successful Kickstarter crowdfunding campaign.

Further, at Kalopsia, Holly was a valued member of the team working well alongside interns and student placements as well as the Directors. Open Change and The Circle respectively believed Jasmin's professionalism, confidence, approachability and people skills impacted on their teams. Fitting in well with the team, Louise's personality was highly valued at Vanilla Ink, and her recruitment enabled Vanilla Ink to fulfil their ethos to educate, inspire and empower.

The impact of hosting a shared MA for Vanilla Ink and Open Change was to get perspective on where there is the potential for additional capacity in their businesses and how this will inform their future development. Vanilla Ink experienced this as a negative impact as they had to reduce their services relative to the reduced capacity in the team after Louise left. Jasmin's employment at Open Change reinforced the fresh, valuable perspective, skills and qualities a young person can bring to their team which they'd started to consider via diversification of the team's age prior to the Pilot Programme.

Open Change has subsequently recruited younger staff from non-creative industry sectors to broaden the team's skillset.

The financial impact of hosting apprentices is considered as direct in terms of expenditure and indirect in terms of the equivalent cost of host organisations' time spent managing and training the apprentice.

Holly's wages were a considerable financial commitment for Kalopsia for two reasons: firstly, she was their first paid member of staff which raised multiple financial operational issues, and secondly they were in the process of transitioning the company's legal status which had associated administrative and legal costs. Their short-term financial concerns evident in their cashflow, informed in the main by their transitional status, were overcome in the longer-term.

Carla and Mairi both saw a positive increase in their turnover during Hannah's employment, primarily due to her increasing their productivity, which in turn increased sales opportunities directly and indirectly to customers. Financing a wage was a big commitment for Carla, at a time when she moved to a more expensive studio. Yet the financial and time investment was worthwhile, as was balancing the amount of time on training and administration. The financial impact on the sole traders was more apparent in the second year of Hannah's employment when the SERI funding subsidising her wages ended. In the first year of employment Hannah worked four days a week and in the second year, three days a week mostly with Carla as this is where she could make the most impact. For Mairi, the indirect financial impact of hosting Hannah was apparent when she stopped attending work.

The financial impact on host organisation's whose apprentices left employment early on in their MA aren't as informative as the employment period was too short to see any benefit.

Louise's wage, subsidised with SERI funding, was paid from the outset of her employment in a two-thirds / one-third split between Vanilla Ink and Katie Lees respectively to reflect her employment in their agreed apprenticeship structure. Whilst this reflected host organisations' joint investment in Louise's training, both commented on the frustration of Katie not benefitting from the MA as Louise left before her placement at Katie's studio.

Operating tight budgets and without a budget line for staff, Gillian at Creative Dundee took the initiative to raise the necessary funds required in addition to the SERI funding to finance Jasmin's wages as she wanted to make the apprenticeship opportunity happen. For Creative Dundee, their hosting an apprenticeship wouldn't have been possible without the subsidy of the SERI funding. At The Circle, the financial impact was indirect in the form of paid staff hours spent supporting and mentoring the apprentice instead of operating the business, which was critical in the start-up phase. Financial impact for Open Change was more about value, the amount of work that can be reasonably expected of an employee who is experiencing work-based learning and being paid an apprenticeship wage.

Learning

Host organisations reflected on what they learnt from their experiences of hosting apprentices, and how this will inform what they would do differently if they delivered an opportunity again. Host organisations' learning is grouped into three primary and three secondary areas:

- Primary:
    i. Value of being organised, planning and preparation
    ii. Importance of defining aims, managing expectations and being strategic
    iii. Value an advantage of staff teams, leading and managing them
- Secondary:
    i. Perspective on the business' purpose, skills and continued learning
    ii. Apprenticeships are a valid route and recruitment process for young people into the creative industries
    iii. Building capacity is a priority

<u>Value of Being Organised, Planning & Preparation</u>

Hosting an apprentice meant sole traders doubled their staff team and micro businesses grew their staff, some for the first time. Through training, supporting, providing work for and managing an apprentice, most host organisations learnt the value of and need to be more organised in their business operations, including planning and preparation. As a sole trader Carla learnt doubling her staff team meant there were two individuals' personalities and time to consider and that she wasn't responsible for all of that.

Kalopsia learnt scheduling, planning and preparing benefited the apprentice and themselves throughout their MA, through alignment of work and studies and in turn their effective joint working. If Kalopsia were to employ an apprentice again they would work with all host organisations to agree a structure and plan to provide the apprentice with guidance and to ensure they got what they needed from and made the most of the opportunity.

Joint planning with partner host organisations was Kirsty' key take away from The Circle's experience of hosting Jasmin. This learning has been implemented in The Circle's subsequent employment and training of apprentices and has informed their current planned approach of a strict schedule of one-to-ones, monthly supervisions and catch-ups, all with the support of a dedicated line manager. Kirsty reiterated The Circle's planned and supervised approach would include a concentrated introductory period to ground the apprentice in the workplace and understand what is expected of the apprentice.

In lieu of working directly with Louise, Katie reflected she learnt how to manage her business better from her preparation to recruit and employ an apprentice. Partner host organisation Vanilla Ink also reflected on the recruitment process, stating the need for more time to plan and prepare, and that this could assist achieving their goal to offer an employment opportunity to someone who wouldn't usually have access to it. If they were to employ an apprentice in the future, Vanilla Ink and Katie Lees agree they would include a bench trial in interviews to gain insights into not only candidates' creative skills, but also their ability to communicate, interact and process information.

<u>Importance of Defining Aims, Managing Expectations and Being Strategic</u>
Alongside planning and preparation, Vanilla Ink require a better understanding of their own aims and expectations to host an apprentice, or another member of staff, and to not throw everything at them at once.

To ensure The Circle considers and manages the expectations of both parties in an employer / apprentice relationship, they now consider the implications of their actions before deciding to embark on opportunities. Open Change, echoed The Circle's learning of the employer's need to give due consideration to their expectations and those of the young person in terms of their skills, future and confidence relative to the scale of the apprenticeship opportunity. Plus, the need to ensure the organisations' expectations are not greater than what the apprentice can bring, retaining the balance of the host organisation in a nurturing and supportive role. Having not given due consideration to the suitability of work at Open Change for the apprentice's given skill and experience levels and sustaining it throughout their employment, Hazel learnt the benefit of defining the role and required skills for the apprenticeship opportunity and to explore this in-depth at interview.

Gillian's learning at Creative Dundee was to be more strategic when offering an apprenticeship, both independently and with their choice of partners. Being strategic, specifically in providing the apprentice and host with context and the opportunity to perform efficiently, was a learning point for Kalopsia. This is reflected in their consideration of being more structured, and results orientated to ensure the apprentice is clear about their role in contributing to and achieving those results, if they were to employ an apprentice again.

<u>Value & Advantage of Staff Teams, Leading and Managing Them</u>
A number of host organisations appreciated the value and advantages of a broader staff team resulting from hosting apprentices. At Open Change, it was about broadening skills in the team, by diversifying staff by age, ability and experience, and learning that they don't need more of the same people in their team.

Holly's age relative to Nina's and Adam's was an initial mild cause for concern for Kalopsia, which was swiftly overcome with Holly's demonstration of her skills, abilities and initiative in the workplace. Via the apprenticeship opportunity, expansion of the Kalopsia team beyond the organisation's two founding Directors required considerable confidence and openness, which reaped the rewards of Kalopsia's development in terms of management, professionalism, ideas generation, working practices and leadership. Kalopsia learnt to be more professional, when to be open and to articulate clearly what they need from staff. Leadership was a key learning outcome for both Nina and Adam at Kalopsia. An experienced leader, Nina honed her leadership skills through listening and opening up to other people's ideas. Actively avoiding being a leader, Adam developed his leadership skills considerably, including guidance and clarity of communication.

At Creative Dundee, Gillian recognised the need for an existing staff team to be aware of their behaviour as an established collective and therefore what they need to shift, including the need for clearer communication and slowing down their pace of working, in order to welcome an apprentice. An additional point of learning for Gillian from her experience of managing Jasmin, specifically her absenteeism, was the need to increase her HR knowledge and skills to be an effective line manager for a young person, especially when taking the lead role across multiple host organisations.

Perspective on the Business' Purpose, Skills and Continued Learning

As a sole trader running her business for 20 years, and first-time employer, Carla valued how hosting Hannah provided her with perspective to understand why she does what she does and simply to keep going. Plus, in training Hannah and observing her skills develop Carla has a refreshed appreciation of the skills and experiences she has accumulated in her jewellery career, which she had perhaps overlooked.

Apprenticeships are a Valid Route & Recruitment Process for Young People into the Creative Industries

Drawing on her previous work and considerable national and international work in the creative industries, Gillian was pleased to support apprenticeships as an alternative route to education into the creative industries. If they were to employ an apprentice again, Creative Dundee would focus the role on a specific project, particularly if hosting someone of a similar age to Jasmin, as expecting them to work across multiple projects is perhaps not appropriate for an apprentice, at least in their first year. Focussed work for the apprentice was a learning outcome for Kirsty, who has subsequently implemented detailed briefs and defined responsibilities in opportunities for young people at The Circle. Like The Circle, Kalopsia have taken a structured approach to hosting student placements since hosting Holly, which is proving an effective route for Kalopsia to recruit staff.

Building Capacity is a Priority

In considering host organisations' learning, only Katie Lees identified building capacity in her future business as a priority as a result of the apprenticeship. Realising she had already taken significant steps to physically accommodate an employee in the studio and increase her clientele, after Louise left Katie swiftly recruited additional support for work in the studio and has improved her ability to delegate jewellery and administrative work.

Next Steps

Host organisations' next steps, are grouped into three areas:

1. Capacity building
2. Keep going
3. Investigating continued provision of apprenticeships

Capacity building was a significant element of the Pilot Programme for host organisations. Host organisations' capacity building next steps are considered from three perspectives: business, skills and opportunities for young people.

To be expected, host organisations taking their next steps to build capacity in their business resulting from hosting an apprentice are primarily focussed on production of either their own products or the products of others. For jewellers Carla and Katie, the experience highlighted where additional skilled workers could support production in their studios. The next steps Carla identified to build capacity in her practice are more general and open-ended. Carla is now confident to consider and dedicate time to designing and producing new product collections and employing or contracting skilled staff to work on particular tasks. For Katie it was the catalyst that informed her to swiftly recruit a part-time jeweller after Louise left as she urgently needed staff to fulfil orders and commissions of her increased clientele in the forthcoming seasonal months. Plus, she could visualise her business growth long-term in which an apprentice would potentially feature in a future business growth stage once a core, skilled, stable team was in place.

Following Kalopsia's positive experience of hosting Holly, like Katie, they've confidently taken immediate action to employ more paid staff and invest in the expected growth of their business. Recruitment is fed by their regular hosting of Heriot Watt University student placements which essentially provides them with an extended interview and skills trials for both parties.

The Circle and Kalopsia were more explicit about their next steps to build capacity are linked to provision of opportunities for young people. Since the conclusion of their apprenticeships, both have employed and supported the development of a number of young people as student placements, volunteers, interns and apprentices in their organisations.

One of The Circle's key areas of work is employability and training young people, since hosting Jasmin they have implemented their learning to shape their offer of more structured, focussed and supervised opportunities, and in three years have worked with 30-40 young people. At Open Change, their capacity building next steps are to recruit appropriately skilled individuals, and to cast their net beyond the creative industries to do this.

For sole traders Mairi and Carla, their next steps take a *'keep going'* approach, in that they will continue to expand and contract their practices in response to markets, economies, customers, clients and opportunities. They acknowledge the work of the apprentice has resourced them to do this.

Vanilla Ink's desired next step is to continue provision of apprenticeships in line with their ethos to educate, inspire and empower the jewellery industry. Their provision of visible, accessible, sustained, well remunerated apprenticeship opportunities for young people that are fit for purpose for the jewellery sector is subject to their finding resources, primarily financial, to make them happen.

// six // Conclusion & Recommendations

The Shared Creative Modern Apprenticeship Pilot Programme fulfilled its objective to understand the feasibility, appropriateness and impact of a contemporary, fit for purpose shared MA model, specifically for the Skills for Craft Business MA, appropriate to micro businesses and sole traders in the craft sector seeking to build capacity in their businesses and practices. It also demonstrated an alternative pathway to education for young people into the craft sector and contributed to conversations about apprenticeships in the craft sector and the wider creative industries, including their potential to address current issues regarding skills retention and preservation of heritage practices, at government level and with UK wide bodies.

The Pilot Programme's six MAs from 2015-2018 trialled the shared model across three MA frameworks, specifically, four apprentices on the Skills for Craft Business MA to establish knowledge, learning and recommendations to inform the next phase of AAS's shared MA programme. AAS and SDS agree this next phase will build on experience, relationships and learning from the Pilot Programme to inform AAS taking a strategic, systematic and sustainable approach to delivery via an appropriate infrastructure, with identified key partners and appropriate resources. Objectives of the next phase can reach beyond capacity building and providing alternative pathways to education for young people into the craft sector, to address important, relevant and current issues in the craft sector of skills retention and preservation of heritage practices.

It is acknowledged the sector experience and knowledge, plus sheer determination of Apprenticeship Project Manager Carol Sinclair including work across multiple partnerships has been fundamental to delivery, as has the significant partnership with SDS, specifically David Martin, Key Sector Manager - Creative Industries.

The Evaluation Report concludes experiences of the employer, host organisations and apprentices to:

1. evaluate the Pilot Programme's outcomes and outputs
2. evaluate the Pilot Programme's successes and impact
3. establish learning to apply to future iterations of AAS's shared MA programme
4. establish opportunities for improvement to apply to future iterations of AAS's shared MA programme
5. understand what is involved in craft micro businesses and sole traders hosting a shared apprentice
6. inform a set of recommendations for taking forward a shared MA model in the craft sector, adaptable by the wider creative industries in Scotland
7. inform the content and format of practical resources to support delivery of shared MAs, and to introduce the model to the wider creative industries as an option for their consideration
8. inform production of a dissemination event, on a to be agreed date, for Creative Scotland staff to encourage taking forward research into apprenticeships and shared MAs in the wider creative industries
9. support AAS's longer term aim to be a sector training body for skills and assessment

In response to the **Conclusion**, specifically six above, a series of **Recommendations** are made to support the next phase of activity.

// six // 1 // Conclusion

1. Pilot Programme's outcomes and outputs

Direct outcomes of the Pilot Programme are complimented by outputs drawn from the employer's experiences of delivery and apprentices' and host organisations' experiences of the opportunity and their next steps.

Outcomes

1. Recruited six modern apprentices aged 16-25 in Edinburgh, Glasgow, Dundee and Inverness:

- Three gained their MA Certificate of Completion, one in Community Arts Management and two in Skills for Craft Business
- Three left and did not complete their apprenticeships

2. Recruited 12 host organisations:
   - Four sole traders, three CICs, one SCIO and five private companies limited by guarantee
   - Based in Glasgow, Edinburgh, Dundee and Inverness
3. Worked with three training providers:
   - Fife College
   - City of Glasgow College
   - Dundee & Angus College
4. Worked with three MA frameworks and two sector skills councils:
   - Creative & Cultural Skills for the MAs in Skills for Craft Business at SCQF Level 7 and Community Arts Management at SCQF Level 6
   - Creative Skillset for the MA in Creative & Digital Media at SCQF Level 7
5. Secured a total of £47,300 from and worked with nine national and local partner organisations for two distinct elements of the Pilot Programme:

   i. AAS's research, administration, management and delivery:
      - Creative Scotland - £5,800
      - Creative & Cultural Skills Creative Employers Incentives Grant - £6,000
      - Skills Development Scotland (SDS) - £10,000
      - Highlands & Islands Enterprise (HIE) - £5,000

   ii. Subsidy of apprentices' wages:
      - Scotland's Employer Recruitment Incentive (SERI), now known as the 'No-One Left Behind Employability Funding Stream', via City of Edinburgh Council, Glasgow City Council, Dundee City Council and Highland Council - £20,500 (equal to £4,000 for four apprentices and £4,500 for one apprentice)
      - SDS Employability Fund via Barnardo's – funding paid direct to the apprentice

Outputs

1. Skills for Craft Business MA framework:
   - In practice is recognised as a good fit with craft micro businesses and sole traders in Scotland's craft sector.
   - The combination of creative and business skills is particularly important and relevant to the craft sector and has the potential to equip young people with valuable skills transferable to the wider creative industries and beyond, for employment and self-employment opportunities.
2. As per the Pilot Programme's objective, the shared MA model can flex to suit partner host organisations' work commitments, workloads and calendars, and therefore shape an apprenticeship structure responsive to the MA and units selected for study offering the apprentice variety and focus as required. This can have positive and negative impacts:
   - Positive – partner host organisations can 'borrow' apprentices when they have too much work or let partners know of apprentices' availability if they don't have enough work to manage peaks and troughs in their work and offer apprentices experiences and opportunities at particularly busy or interesting times to support their work and learning.
   - Negative – the practice of 'borrowing' an apprentice can be taken advantage of by the apprentice by playing host organisations off against each other.
3. The Apprenticeship Project Manager had most impact when on hand and present in person to communicate with apprentices and host organisations.

4. Micro businesses and sole traders in the craft sector are open to and interested in being host organisations to:
    - Explore building capacity in their businesses / practices
    - Offer young people an opportunity to experience working in the creative industries
    - Introduce young people to an alternative pathway to education into the craft sector
    - Give something back
    - Diversify their work force in terms of age, ability, skills, etc.
5. Craft micro businesses and sole traders are attracted to shared MAs for the following reasons:
    - Management and Administration
        - AAS's administrative support via the Apprenticeship Project Manager
        - AAS's role as adviser, mediator and facilitator via the Apprenticeship Project Manager
        - Apprenticeship Project Manager's availability to support the apprentice if problems arose
    - Financial
        - Shared cost of an apprentice's full-time wage with partner host organisations
        - Available funds to subsidise the apprentice's wages
    - Employment and Workload
        - Part-time nature
        - Collectively, with partner host organisations offering enough full-time work to an apprentice for a year
    - Partnership working
        - Knowing, trusting and able to talk openly and honestly with partner host organisations about how things are going and when challenges arise
        - Operating at the same scale and career stage as partner host organisations
        - Working and collaborating with local partner host organisations to share the risks of hosting an apprentice, particularly if it is for the first time
    - Training and Education
        - Shared responsibility with host organisations to offer an apprentice a variety of experiences and training in creative skills in different organisations
        - The Skills for Craft Business MA offers the apprentice the opportunity to learn business and creative skills
        - Affiliation with a training provider and opportunity for the apprentice to gain a qualification
    - Young People
        - Opportunity to offer young people exposure to and experience(s) of working in creative business(es) in different sectors, and an introduction to an alternative pathway to education into the creative industries
        - Funding prioritised people with disabilities and disadvantages
6. Whether school leavers, part-time workers, unemployed or freelancers, young people actively seek apprenticeships in the creative industries as a route into the sector. Apprentices are attracted to shared MAs for the following reasons:
    - Job involves working with your hands
    - Work is part-time
    - Job pays a good wage for a part-time apprentice role
    - Opportunity encouraged applications from individuals with disabilities and disadvantages
    - Potential to meet other creative practitioners and organisations that may feature in future practice / business
7. Since hosting an apprentice, 50% of host organisations have actively recruited staff and student placements into their micro businesses:
    - Katie Lees Jewellery – employed a part-time jeweller to work in the studio
    - The Circle – in three years have worked with 30-40 young people as apprenticeships and volunteers

- Open Change – employed a former intern
- Creative Edinburgh – continued direct employment of their shared modern apprentice
- Highland Print Studio - continued direct employment of their shared modern apprentice
- Kalopsia – regularly hosted student placements, some of whom have become employees

8. Since completing their MAs, young people have progressed to work (employed and freelance) and study in the creative industries.
9. Since completing their MA, one young person is actively seeking an autism diagnosis to support their addressing difficulties experienced in the workplace for their future employment.
10. Received a visit from Ms Fiona Hyslop MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Culture, Tourism and External Affairs during Apprenticeship Week 2016.
11. Initiated research into running the shared Skills for Craft Business MA in rural areas Orkney, Angus / Aberdeenshire and South of Scotland (Borders / Dumfries & Galloway).

2. Pilot Programme's successes and impact

The Pilot Programme's successes and impacts draw on the employer's, apprentices' and host organisations' experiences, and compliments the above outcomes and outputs.

Successes

1. The Skills for Craft Business MA's choice of units are a strong fit to the work and practice of craft micro businesses and sole traders.
2. An established membership organisation operating in local and national networks, AAS is well positioned to recruit host organisations, supported by Apprenticeship Project Manager Carol Sinclair's considerable knowledge and experience of working with sole traders and micro businesses in Scotland's craft sector.
3. The combination of the shared MA model and AAS as employer gave micro businesses and sole traders who operate precariously in terms of finance and resources and don't feel in a position financially, administratively or in terms of sufficient workload to offer and support a full-time apprentice, the confidence to take the risk to employ, many for the first time.
4. Host organisations' pre-existing working and professional relationships, or knowledge of each other through local creative industries networks, local proximity and similar visions and objectives featured prominently in their management and delivery of the MA, including agreement of the apprenticeship structure.
5. The part-time nature of the shared MA model means it can flex to suit partner host organisations' work commitments, workloads and work calendars, services and seasonality and peaks and troughs in work and is therefore fit for purpose and appropriate for craft micro businesses and sole traders.
6. Professional craftspeople with dyslexia and dyspraxia were motivated to support young people experiencing similar or related issues and potentially barriers to employment with an opportunity to be welcomed into working in the craft sector.
7. To host apprentices, and in turn student placements or employ staff, host organisations learnt:
   - The value of and need to be organised, plan and prepare
   - The importance of defining their aims, managing expectations and being strategic
   - The value and advantage of having a staff team, and their effective leadership and management
   - Apprenticeships are a valid route and recruitment process for young people into the creative industries

8. Host organisations developed existing and new leadership roles and associated skills including listening, guidance and clarity of communication which in turn realised development of their working practices including team management and ideas generation.
9. Apprentices' learnt the following from their apprenticeships:
    - Grown in confidence, specifically with talking to work colleagues and receiving praise from them
    - Want to continue working in the creative industries / a creative job
    - Their strengths and weaknesses
    - They have additional support needs in the workplace, and experience difficulty working if these are not met
    - They like working, and more importantly working with people
    - Learning and creative thinking from their apprenticeship can be laterally applied to subsequent work whether within or outwith the creative industries
    - To share their weaknesses / what they aren't capable of with employers sooner to explore alternatives
    - Require a physical space to work in to avoid lone and independent working
10. Whether they completed their apprenticeships or not, young peoples' swift growth at the beginning of their MAs, primarily increased confidence and acceptance, particularly for apprentices with disadvantages and disabilities.
11. Apprentices can transfer skills and learning between host organisations.
12. Via host organisations examples, young people saw their employment options could be shaped and informed by what they are passionate about or believe in by being given a chance to do something that they really enjoyed.
13. With SDS and Pilot Programme partners, AAS has raised the subject of what apprenticeships are in practice today, specifically exploration of a shared model as contemporary and fit for purpose, and therefore appropriate to the craft sector's micro businesses and sole traders.
14. AAS has contributed and is contributing to conversations about apprenticeships in the craft sector and the wider creative industries, including their potential to address current issues regarding skills retention and preservation of heritage practices, at government level and with UK wide bodies such as the Heritage Crafts Association.
15. AAS have realised additional value in the potential to transfer the shared MA model to other creative industries, specifically its sole traders, the prevalent legal entity in the sector, with Carol initiating conversations with organisations and bodies similar to AAS in other creative industry disciplines well positioned to be the employer and adopt the Apprenticeship Project Manager broker role.
16. Micro businesses who support craft disciplines / industries, such as Vanilla Ink, are not concerned about an apprentice setting up their own practice after completing an MA with them as they wouldn't be direct competition, indeed businesses like Vanilla Ink feel well positioned to host shared MA apprentices that will feed the wider jewellery industry.

Impact

As per the Pilot Programme's objective, host organisations reported employment of a shared MA enabled them to build capacity in their businesses. This was both tangible and intangible:

- Tangible - primarily for host organisations providing multiple services or with a focus on production of their own work or the work of others, in the form of increased production, sales and income, established resources to support day-to-day running of the business, set up and run physical spaces for production and online spaces for sales.

- Intangible – via their direct experience host organisations whose apprentices did not complete their MAs gained perspective on where there is potential for additional capacity their businesses and how this will inform their future development.

Additional impact of the professional, confident and approachable shared MAs on host organisations was enhancement of their teams, service delivery, resilience and achievement of goals.

Financial impact of the MAs on host organisations was direct in terms of expenditure on apprentices' wages and indirect in terms of the equivalent cost of host organisations' time spent managing and training the apprentice. Host organisations short-term financial concerns of paying the apprentices' wages, due to regular and one-off business expenditure, were overcome in the longer-term, with financial and time investment seen as worthwhile, and offset by SERI funding, which a number of host organisations said they could not have provided a shared modern apprentice without. The indirect financial impact was paid staff hours spent supporting and mentoring the apprentice instead of operating the business or running the practice.

The size of the Pilot Programme is too small to demonstrate significant quantitative impact. To support evidencing the tangible impact and benefits of building capacity in host organisations' businesses, Carol will undertake an additional piece of in-depth research with Carla Edwards Jewellery to understand her financial gain and risk taken during the employment period of the apprentice.

Apprentices believed they impacted host organisations as:

- Their work is still being actively used
- They were offered additional and continued employment beyond the apprenticeship
- They fitted in with and enhanced the team
- They provided their first experience of employing a member of staff

The Pilot Programme demonstrated alternative pathways to education into the craft sector for young people with apprentices sustaining employment with their host organisations, other businesses in the creative industries and undertaking freelance work.

3. Learning to apply to future iterations of AAS's shared MA programme

1. Clearly specify criteria and person specification in MA job descriptions and work with representatives of national organisations, local youth and employment networks, national and local partners to promote opportunities and obtain referrals, specifically if targeting opportunities at young people with disabilities and disadvantages, with the aim of receiving more relevant and eligible applications.
2. Sustain support from experienced representatives of national and local organisations with expertise and skills of supporting young people in education, the workplace and skills development to:
    - Support the employer, host organisations and apprentices, particularly with informing how they manage their expectations throughout the MA
    - Assist the craft sector to see the value of diversifying their work force in terms of age and ability
    - Sustain long-term investment of multiple partners into an agreed apprenticeship strategy for the craft sector
3. Acknowledging they were lacking, AAS as employer and host organisations are:
    - Hungry to gain HR skills and knowledge of policies and procedures to confidently support their employment and hosting of apprentices.
    - Keen to access focussed and specialised HR expertise to specifically support apprentices with disabilities and disadvantages in the workplace (see 2. below in **4. Opportunities for improvement to apply to future iterations of AAS's shared MA programme**).
4. Retain the part-time nature of the shared MA to:

- Enable apprentices to work with multiple host organisations to gain a variety of experiences, opportunities and training.
- Provide flexibility to suit partner host organisations' work commitments, workloads and work calendars, services and seasonality and peaks and troughs in work and is therefore fit for purpose and appropriate for craft micro businesses and sole traders.

5. With a caveat (see 2. below in **4. Opportunities for improvement to apply to future iterations of AAS's shared MA programme**), continue to provide MA opportunities targeted at young people with disabilities and disadvantages.
6. To overcome problematic remote-delivery of MAs, specifically regular face-to-face contact with apprentices, resource AAS's Apprenticeship Project Manager's time for and travel to areas in which MAs are delivered to enable them to be on hand and present in person to meet with apprentices and host organisations, to manage communications and recognise nuances in behaviour quicker to enable issues and challenges to be dealt with sooner.
7. Review agreements with host organisations and employment contracts with apprentices to share the responsibility to observe, highlight and raise problems and importantly, to support the young person to develop independence through the work-based learning opportunity.
8. Review the regularity and format of:
    - Check ins between the employer and apprentice
    - Check ins between the host organisations and apprentice
    - Meetings between the apprentice and training provider
    - Group meetings and reviews by the employer, host organisations, apprentice and training provider
9. Continue to align the MA schedule with host organisations' commercial work calendars, and work to inform training providers of the reasons why this is necessary for craft micro businesses and sole traders and will optimise the MA experience for the young person.
10. Continue to work with funders and key partners to ensure MA delivery schedules align across host organisations and training providers, specifically in relation to funding, preferably long-term incentive funding rather than a slate of small funds.
11. Employer support host organisations to gain a clear understanding of their motivations, reasons, aims for and expectations of hosting an apprentice in their business, to inform their entering into, becoming a partner in and approach to hosting a shared MA and to optimise their and the young person's experience.
12. Request an individual from one host organisation takes a lead supervision role of the apprentice and compliment's AAS's Apprenticeship Project Manager' role.
13. Pace the recruitment process to enable partner host organisations with the employer to:
    - Align their reasons for and expectations of hosting an apprentice
    - Identify and agree roles and responsibilities
    - Consider their available time, work commitments, workloads and work calendars to plan and agree an appropriate apprenticeship structure that is also responsive to the MA and selected units to be studied
    - Agree a MA job description with appropriate skill levels and scope of work, relevant and of interest to a young person potentially aged 16 and a school leaver, and balanced for both host organisations and the apprentice
    - Targeted promotion of the opportunity to young people, specifically individuals with disabilities and disadvantages, to increase receipt of more relevant and eligible applications.
    - Secure national and local funding

14. Once appointed, the modern apprentice with the employer and host organisations collectively select their MA units, and review selection at regular meetings with the training provider.
15. Employer and host organisations develop and incorporate a concentrated introductory period at the beginning of the MA to support apprentices' familiarity with and transition from education to the workplace, which some may be experiencing for the first time, for all to get to know each other and enable apprentices to develop formative basic skills of time keeping, punctuality, self-presentation and communicating with clients.
16. Consider alternative apprenticeship structures appropriate to host organisations and the apprentice, such as placing the apprentice with each host organisations for a week on continuous rotation enabling the apprentice to bring their learning from one host to the next and provide each host with time to accumulate, plan and prepare work for the apprentice for when they are placed with them.
17. To optimise the MA for both host organisations and the apprentice and support communication and partners' unified operations and management of the apprenticeship, with the employer's support, plan and agree an apprenticeship structure detailing the apprentice's placements (timing, duration and rotation) with host organisations that incorporates and is responsive to:
    - Apprentice's studies, including their selected MA units (their focus, learning outcomes, topics of enquiry, etc.), existing skills and interests, and the skills they seek to learn and opportunities they seek to experience
    - Host organisations' services and seasonality, work commitments, peaks and troughs in workload
    - The training provider's study and assessment schedule
    - The agreed schedule of check ins, group and review meetings

    The apprenticeship structure should be an active document, referenced and reviewed throughout the MA at regular meetings and check ins.

4. Opportunities for improvement to apply to future iterations of AAS's shared MA programme

Building on the collective experiences and learning the next phase of AAS's shared MA programme should make the following improvements:

1. To avoid not meeting the expectations of young people with disabilities and disadvantages entering a workplace in which they anticipate additional support, it is advised AAS do not offer shared MAs with host organisations targeted at these young people until focussed and specialised HR expertise and advice is secured (see 2. below) to support (which may take the form of training, a Manual, access to an adviser) their responsible employment.
2. Secure focussed and specialised HR expertise and advice to support:
    - AAS's drafting of a Manual and Training Development Plan template.
    - Host organisations to manage and navigate the 'employer / employee' relationship including understanding their duty of care for an employee, employee absenteeism, and building honest and open working relationships to support employee's progression, development and responsibility for themselves.
    - AAS and host organisations to manage apprentices' disclosures / non-disclosures of disabilities, disadvantages and mental health.
    - AAS and host organisations to support apprentices with disabilities and disadvantages with assessment of the workplace and implementation of any resulting additional support needs and reasonable adjustments.
    - AAS and host organisations to draft training development plans with apprentices to support their progression through the MA.
    - AAS and host organisations to understand the support available from government departments and external support agencies for young people with disabilities and disadvantages in the workplace, how to access and negotiate it.

- AAS to provide apprentices with the pastoral care they require.
- AAS and host organisations with motivation and encouragement of apprentices, specifically those with learning difficulties, to sustain and grow their confidence, ability and self-belief levels and support their progression, development, independence and responsibility for themselves.

3. Clearly articulate and raise awareness of alternative pathways to education for young people into the craft sector, primarily the shared Skills for Craft Business MA, to both young people and craft micro businesses and sole traders to bust the polarised myth of the type and availability of apprenticeships.
4. Explore options for long-term national and local incentive funds for micro businesses and sole traders, beyond the SERI funding, that align with long-term multiple partners working towards an agreed MA strategy for the craft sector and the wider creative industries. Locally, these funds will not only support the employment and retention of young people but sustain existing micro businesses and sole traders. This includes Carol's continued conversations with QEST about the fit of their Apprenticeships Award to part-time MAs for craft micro businesses and sole traders in Scotland.
5. Incorporate SDS's employability fund, or equivalent, into the MA recruitment process for young peoples' trial employment periods with host organisations to experience potential workplaces, and for them and host organisations to establish if the opportunity is appropriate for both parties and they can work together, and enable any issues or concerns to be raised earlier in the relationship, before formally committing to a MA.
6. Include a simple creative skill learning activity at interview to gain an insight into not only candidates' skill level, but also their ability to communicate, interact and process information.
7. Provide and facilitate a peer-to-peer support network of shared modern apprentices in which young people can share their experiences with and get to know others in a similar situation.
8. AAS work closely with one training provider with the ability and capacity for remote training delivery and assessment to improve their knowledge of micro businesses and sole traders currently practising in the craft sector to provide context for their delivery of the Skills for Craft Business MA and to:
    - Reinforce their responsibility for the apprentices' studies, progression with coursework and its submission for assessment and the apprentices' accountability
    - Request they appoint a lead contact for the apprentice and AAS's Apprenticeship Project Manager
    - Request training providers' written reassurance of and clarity about the availability of their support to and resources for apprentices, specifically for young people with learning difficulties, how it can be accessed and when, ideally via an individual contact at the training provider
9. Continue conversations with micro businesses and sole traders in the craft sector in different disciplines and geographical locations, and of different sizes and scales of operation to inform possible variations of the shared MA model, particularly the apprenticeship structure, to continue testing if it is fit for purpose.
10. Build on the trialled shared MA model, by Carol's exploration of two further models to enable craft micro businesses and sole traders to maintain their production and income whilst offering a work-based learning opportunity for a young person:
    - A facilitated part-time apprenticeship in which an apprentice employed part-time directly by two employers whilst studying their MA, supported by a facilitator from the sector, such as AAS.

- Full-time study and part-time employment in which an apprentice studies full-time and is employed part-time directly by one employer, providing the apprentice with more time to study outside their employment.

11. Investigate the possibility of AAS becoming a sector training body for skills and assessment, what would be involved and how it would be resourced to deliver a shared MA programme appropriate for and true to the craft sector, that draws on AAS's network of professional makers, many with educational experience, with a view to the sector looking after the sector.
12. Once drafted, incorporate apprenticeship development plans and shared documents alongside the apprenticeship structure (see 17. above in **3. Learning to apply to future iterations of AAS's shared MA programme**) for the apprentice to support progression through their MA with unified support and encouragement to work independently and b self-directed.
13. To overcome problematic remote-delivery of MAs, specifically regular face-to-face contact with apprentices, consider recruitment of local part-time Apprenticeship Project Managers to be on hand and present in person to meet with apprentices and host organisations, to manage communications and recognise nuances in behaviour quicker to enable issues and challenges to be dealt with sooner.

5. Understand what is involved in craft micro businesses and sole traders hosting a shared apprentice

Craft Micro businesses and sole traders are interested in hosting a shared apprentice if they want or have the desire to achieve one or more of the following:

- Build capacity in their business / practice, whether they:
  - provide multiple services
  - focus on production of their own work or the work of others
  - set up or run physical spaces for production
  - set up and manage online services (e.g. selling)
  - require resources to support the day-to-day running of their business
- Offer young people an opportunity to experience working in the creative industries and an introduction to an alternative pathway to education into the craft sector
- Fulfil the vision, objective, ethos of their business, which is likely to be a social enterprise
- Give something back
- Diversify their work force in terms of age, ability, skills, etc.

Craft micro businesses and sole traders are at the right stage to host a shared apprentice if they are:

- Are established
- Have a regularity to their working pattern
- Have or are strategically seeking to build capacity
- Have some previous experience of employing staff or contracting freelancers
- Are keen to support a young person to gain skills or experience
- Are seeking a development opportunity

Further, some micro businesses and sole traders are better placed to host apprentices if they have accumulated experience, specifically in staffing / contracting / partnership working / project delivery, have available financial and physical resources and a workload through their studios. Business start-ups are not conducive to hosting apprentices. Creative industry businesses providing untraditional services (e.g. service design) relative to how creativity and digital are taught in the school curriculum, require further interrogation to consider the role and required skills for the work to be done by the apprentice from the young person's perspective to ensure it reflects the job accurately and is relevant and attractive to individuals.

Craft micro business and sole traders wanting to host a shared apprentice are likely to have minimal and limited knowledge of apprenticeships and little to no direct experience of employing staff. Some may have experience of having additional support via contracted freelancers, student placements, paid work placements and interns.

To optimise a MA opportunity for both partner host organisations and apprentices, specifically their future career in the creative industries, partner host organisations need to dedicate time to the planning and preparation stages:

- Independently:
  - Honestly identify why they want to host an apprentice
  - Define their expectations of the MA: role, objectives, person specification of the young person, etc.
  - Understand their available time to host, manage and importantly train an apprentice
- Collectively
  - To align reasons for and expectations of hosting an apprentice
  - Identify and agree roles and responsibilities
  - Consider their available time, work commitments, workloads and work calendars, services and seasonality to plan and agree an appropriate apprenticeship structure that is also responsive to the MA to be studied
  - Agree a job description with appropriate skill levels and scope of work, of relevance and interest to a young person potentially aged 16 and a school leaver, and is a balanced opportunity for host organisations and the apprentice

Host organisations' expectations of hosting an apprentice will vary from business to business. Examples include:

- Highlight what running an independent craft business looks like
- Mentor an apprentice
- Support and encourage an apprentice to apply their talents
- Train the apprentice to play a critical role in their craft business
- Support the apprentice to learn specific skills to produce work for the business and make their own piece of work
- Provide mutual benefit to the host organisation and apprentice

To manage their expectations of hosting an apprentice craft micro businesses and sole traders may need to research MAs in their own discipline / sector and / or others to understand the scope of offering the opportunity and importantly understand more about the young people who may be interested in the role and that they may not be self-starters used to working in fast paced, agile, small creative organisations.

Host organisations need to consider the practicalities of hosting an apprentice:

- Provision of physical work space relative to the existing team
- Provision of specialist equipment and tools necessary for the apprentice's work
- Revision or introduction of policies and procedures, e.g. emergency contact form
- Need for behaviour and dynamic of an established staff team to shift to accommodate new team members, e.g. clearer communication and slowing down pace of working

Recruitment for shared MAs is a joint effort between the employer and partner host organisations; agreeing the job description, drafting the opportunity, promoting via their own networks, local youth and employment networks, shortlisting applicants, interviewing and appointing the preferred candidate. Recruitment is more impactful in terms of realising appropriate, well-suited applications to the opportunity if it is targeted and done in partnership, rather than via an open call, specifically if targeting individuals with disabilities and disadvantages. In addition, a well-researched, job description will assist host organisations to explore in more depth the suitability of short-listed candidates to the MA at interview in terms of skills, ability, interests and fit with the studio and / or staff team.

An apprenticeship may be a young person's first experience of the workplace. Therefore, in addition to providing the apprentice with training in the craft and business skills required of the MA framework, host organisations should incorporate a concentrated introductory period supporting apprentices' transition to and familiarity with the workplace, some for the first time, an opportunity to get to know

each other and to embed formative, basic skills of time keeping, punctuality, self-presentation and communicating with clients.

As apprentices' wages are regulated by National Minimum Wage and National Living Wage rates if aged 25 and over, budgeting for payment of an apprentice's monthly wages is subject to their age and the number of years they have been employed as an apprentice with one employer. An additional variable is the percentage of apprentices' wages each partner host organisation will pay relative to the period of time they will host the apprentice within the agreed apprenticeship structure, and an associated payment plan.

The costs involved in hosting an apprentice are:

1. Direct in terms of regular payment of their wages and resourcing with equipment
2. Indirect in terms of the equivalent costs of training and management, which would otherwise be spent being productive, e.g. designing, making, marketing, selling

Short-term financial concerns about paying apprentices' wages, and indeed higher wages, can be mitigated in the longer-term via financial planning in a cashflow over the period of the apprentice's employment, and in considering the apprentices' contribution to work and production, plus the team and businesses' goals. Low apprenticeship wages will appeal as an affordable method of employment, however micro businesses and sole traders should remember it reflects paying someone to learn on the job and understand apprentices recognise this is reflected in the rate they are paid.

The shared MA model can flex to suit partner host organisations' work commitments, workloads and calendars, plus services and seasonality and therefore shape an apprenticeship structure responsive to the MA and units selected for study offering the apprentice variety and focus as required. For example:

- Host organisations in different craft disciplines host an apprentice once for an equal period of time during the MA year.
- Host organisations in different craft disciplines host an apprentice for an equal period of time during the MA year on rotation.
- Host organisations in the same craft discipline host an apprentice for an agreed, consecutive period of time relevant to the discipline's services and seasonality and optimising the opportunity for apprentices to accumulate and progress skills, knowledge and experiences in a specific craft discipline.

Further, within the apprenticeship structure, host organisations can decide if the modern apprentices' work will focus on specific tasks, activities or projects to support their learning and skills development or take in a broad scope of work in the business / practice.

In hosting an apprentice, micro businesses and sole traders will need to balance:

- Time:
  - Timing and duration of the apprentices' placement with them as per the apprenticeship structure
  - Time apprentices spend on specific projects / activities / tasks
  - Time hosts spend training apprentices
  - Fluidity of time to accommodate leave / illness / absenteeism
- Workload - the amount, variety and frequency of work at varying skill and supervision levels that can be delegated to apprentices to enable their learning and development of skills and experience, and independent working, whilst building capacity in the organisations
- Planning – a continuous planning process building on the apprenticeship structure agreed at the outset of the opportunity, to manage workloads, staffing schedules, for review, training, partnerships, etc.

The value and enjoyment of hosting an apprentice can include:

- Gained perspective on their business:

    - Opportunity to step outside of the business and look in rather than being constantly caught up in it
    - Understanding why they do what they do
    - A refreshed appreciation for their accumulated skills and experiences, perhaps overlooked day-to-day
    - Learning what is needed to support operations and what they would do differently in the future when employing apprentices and hosting student placements
    - Understand some of the not immediately apparent skills needed in the businesses
    - Need to build resilience
- Apprentices:
    - Fresh perspective on the work and who they do it for
    - Personality, character, confidence and professionalism
    - Application of natural creative talent to role and ability to hit the ground running
    - Hunger to learn and the ability to pass skills on
    - Fit with team and working cultures and development in response to this
    - Development of confidence in hand skills and ability to work more independently
    - Interest in and validation of work

Challenges of hosting an apprentice include:

- Communication between all parties
- Training providers:
    - Performance and professionalism
    - Navigating and clarifying roles and responsibilities
    - Understand the parameters of input to the apprentices' formal MA studies and coursework
    - Penetrate the college system and MA framework
    - Understand apprentices' study schedule to plan and tailor work-based learning accordingly, to ensure it is relevant and timely
- Resolution of total expenditure by employer and partner host organisations on the shared apprentices' wages and expenses
- Apprentice taking advantage of the opportunity of having an employer and multiple host organisations and playing them off against each other
- Apprentices' disinterest in or lack of taking initiative to be active in their formal studies and work-based learning to achieve their MA Certificate of Completion
- Apprentices' workload:
    - Ensuring a balance of experience so the apprentice gets what they need out of the apprenticeship personally, professionally and for their studies
    - Knowing when too much work is too much
    - Having enough work across a range of supervision levels
    - Sustaining a workload throughout an apprenticeship for an apprentice with limited skills applicable to the required work
- Apprentices' conduct:
    - Punctuality and unreliability, and their lack of awareness of its impact on host organisations' work
    - Unexplained and increased frequency of absences
    - Masking, avoiding and not being open about what they struggle with, find difficult, aren't getting to, causes anxiety, becomes too much
- Apprentices experience challenges with their MAs if they:
    - Are overwhelmed with a large amount or too much variety of work that is lacking in structure or timing
    - Don't have enough time for their college work
    - Lack contact with and support from the training providers, specifically for young people with disabilities and disadvantages

    - Are required to do work they are unfamiliar with, unconfident and unsure of
    - Are expected to work alone and have too much independence
    - Don't know exactly what the work is they are supposed to be doing
- During their MAs, apprentices may balance the following:
    - Their learning and development of creative and business skills with host organisations alongside college coursework
    - Their time outside employment to enable continued paid freelance work
    - Generating income beyond their apprenticeship wage from additional employed work and paid freelance work to support their living costs
    - Caring for family members
- Apprentices feel supported by their host organisations and enjoy / value their MA if they:
    - Are welcomed into a team
    - Have opportunities to engage in live interesting projects and activity within and outwith the business relevant to their MA and professional and personal interests in the creative industries
    - Are in a safe and supportive environment to push themselves to try new things and learn new skills
    - Are able to apply and develop existing skills
    - Have the opportunity to meet people and learn from them
    - Have a creative output
    - Are respected by others for their work
    - Have the opportunity to grow

Young people in apprenticeships, particularly those with disabilities and disadvantages, require the following HR support from their employer and host organisations:

- Navigation of the 'employer / employee' relationship, particularly with apprentices' absenteeism, openness and honesty about their work and studies to aid their progression
- Assessment of their additional support needs and provision of reasonable adjustments in the workplace
- Pastoral care
- Motivation and encouragement to sustain and grow their confidence, ability, independence and self-belief levels

As a host organisation of a shared modern apprentice, support is primarily provided by the employer, in this instance AAS, partner host organisations and the training provider. If the young person has disabilities and disadvantages additional support in the workplace may be available to them via the training provider and external support agencies. This requires investment of the employers' and host organisations' time and energy to achieve results in the MA timeframe of one year. Additional support may also be available to the employer and host organisations via incentive funds to employ young people with disabilities and disadvantages, e.g. SERI funding.

Finally, hosting an apprentice in a micro business or sole trader's practice that seeks to build capacity is likely to be a long-term investment and potentially via a series of apprentices and potentially employees. Therefore, time should be given to consider the business' / practice's future relevant to not only the MA opportunity but also future employment of staff or recruitment of contractors that may follow on from and respond to, or be independent to their employing an apprentice.

6. Recommendations for taking forward a shared MA model in the craft sector, adaptable to the wider creative industries in Scotland

Recommendations for AAS's improved project management, efficient delivery and brokerage of the next phase of the shared MA programme in the craft sector, adaptable to the wider creative industries, are presented in **// six // 2 // Recommendations** (pages 49-52).

7. Practical resources to support delivery of shared MAs, and to introduce the model to the wider creative industries as an option for their consideration

Apprentices and host organisations knowledge of apprenticeships was minimal and limited to 'master / apprentice' models, large-scale programmes in industries such as construction and programmes such as the QEST Apprenticeship Award that are unsuitable for host organisations' size and scale of operation, specifically the requirement to offer full-time employment and the associated financial commitment and workload. In addition to not accessing or engaging with information about apprenticeships in the craft sector and wider creative industries in advance, apprentices and host organisations had little to no engagement in resources to support them during the MAs.

Two types of practical resources are proposed:

1. Promotional materials to raise young peoples' and craft micro businesses' and sole traders' awareness of and insight into the features and benefits of shared MAs in the craft sector, specifically the Skills for Craft Business MA, and increase their knowledge of options to study and work in the craft sector.
2. Documents, enhancing AAS's trusted role as Apprenticeship Project Manager and relationship broker, to support delivery of MAs by partner host organisations, predominantly micro businesses and sole traders, and overcome their concerns about the practicalities, legalities, discrimination and financial risks of hosting an apprentice.

The format and content of the above practical resources are proposed as (detailed in the full version of the Evaluation Report):

- Promotional materials
- Capacity building diagnostic
- Manual
- Apprenticeship development plans
- Shared working documents
- Money

Practical resources should draw on employer's, apprentices' and host organisations' experiences and learning from the Pilot Programme and are therefore proposed as being 'written by the sector, for the sector', and primarily for use by AAS in the next phase of their shared MA programme, so therefore 'disseminated by the sector to the sector'. Further, there is some additional key prior knowledge and experience of apprenticeships in host organisations with the potential to be harnessed for these resources.

8. Dissemination event for Creative Scotland staff to encourage taking forward research into apprenticeships and shared MAs in the wider creative industries

At the outset of researching and writing the Evaluation Report funded by Creative Scotland, a dissemination event was planned to share findings and learning with staff with a view to informing and encouraging their taking forward research into apprenticeships for shared MAs in the wider creative industries. Due to a staffing change at Creative Scotland's Creative Industries team the date for this dissemination event is under review.

9. AAS's longer term aim to be a sector training body for skills and assessment

From her experience as Apprenticeship Project Manager and representative of employer AAS, Carol believes there is a longer-term possibility of AAS becoming a sector training body for skills and assessment for delivery of the Skills for Craft Business MA in Scotland. This is with a view to realising the following, and importantly skills training / development / transfer / retention, capacity building in micro businesses and sole traders and attract new talent into the sector via non-education routes:

- overcoming issues experienced with training providers
- working more effectively with and for the craft sector
- drawing on their network of professional makers, many with educational experience, with the potential for income generation for trainers and assessors

- providing an MA true to the craft sector and what it requires

AAS will research what is involved in their becoming a sector training body for skills and assessment and to how to resource it via initial contact and meetings with CCSkills and SDS,

// six // 2 // Recommendations

The following 10 recommendations are made to support AAS's development of a strategic, systematic and sustainable approach to and infrastructure for delivery of the next phase of the shared MA programme in the craft sector with identified key partners and appropriate resources.

1. Focus on delivery of the Skills for Craft Business MA only

Now approved and available AAS should focus on delivery of the Skills for Craft Business MA framework only in Scotland's contemporary and traditional craft sector. This should build on AAS's strengths, knowledge base and networks to:

- Increase the number of shared MAs in the craft sector
- Impact of the shared MA to build capacity in craft micro businesses and sole traders
- Raise awareness of shared MAs an alternative pathway to education for young people into the craft sector
- Continue conversations at government level and with UK wide bodies about shared MAs being a contemporary and fit for purpose model to in the craft sector, and the wider creative industries, with potential to address current issues regarding skills retention and preservation of heritage practices
- Place the MA which offers craft business skills in context of other qualifications
- Improve the training providers' knowledge of micro businesses and sole traders currently practising in the craft sector to provide context for their delivery of the MA with the employer and host organisations

AAS's resources and expertise should focus on the smooth operation and delivery of the Skills for Craft Business MA framework with reliable remote training provision and assessment by informed training providers, variety of apprenticeship structures in partnership host organisations from different disciplines and geographies, and reach to young people. This will give a solid, experienced base on which to make adaptations or variations of the model for delivery in for example rural areas.

2. Actively partner training providers to recruit for the Skills for Craft Business MA, including improving their knowledge of the craft sector to provide context for delivery

With brokerage support from SDS, AAS should establish productive partnerships with training providers to proactively raise young peoples' awareness of and access to the MA and available opportunities that are authentic to the craft sector. This includes improving the training providers' knowledge of micro businesses and sole traders currently practising in the craft sector to provide context for promotion and delivery of the MA which in turn will inform training providers setting their apprenticeship quote for the MA.

In the next phase of the shared MA programme AAS need to identify a training provider(s) experienced in remote delivery and assessment and have a track record in the creative sector.

3. Craft micro businesses and sole traders propose being partner host organisations of a MA

Whether in distinct craft disciplines or not, craft micro businesses and sole traders should propose being partner host organisations of MAs and approach AAS. Partners should nominate an individual from one host as the lead contact for AAS's Apprenticeship Project Manager and as the apprentice's supervisor.

To achieve this AAS need to raise awareness of the Skills for Craft Business MA with micro businesses and sole traders in the craft sector. This can be done via proposed **'Build the Capacity of Your Craft Business' workshops** in seven below and could facilitate micro businesses and sole traders interested in the MA opportunity to partner to become host organisations. Further the proposed

‘Capacity building diagnostic’ (detailed in the full version of the Evaluation Report) can support micro businesses and sole traders to understand their reasons for and expectations of hosting a MA and communicate and negotiate these with potential partners.

4. Secure HR support, specifically focussed and specialised
HR support is fundamental to AAS’s continued delivery of the shared MA programme. As many craft micro businesses and sole traders have no prior experience of being an employer, basic HR advice, skills, policies, procedures and best practice are necessary and could feature prominently in the proposed Manual (detailed in the full version of the Evaluation Report) alongside the advice and experiences of the employer and host organisations. The type of HR support required is outlined in two above in **4. Opportunities for improvement to apply to future iterations of AAS’s shared MA programme** (pages 41-42). It is proposed AAS seek in kind or sponsored HR support form national arts / creative industry organisations such as Creative Scotland or a legal firm.

As per one above in **4. Opportunities for improvement to apply to future iterations of AAS’s shared MA programme** (page 41) it is advised AAS do not offer MAs targeted at young people with disabilities and disadvantages until focussed and specialised HR support is secured to avoid the risk of providing unsuitable opportunities which if mismanaged or do not meet apprentices’ expectations have the potential to impact on a young person’s formative experiences of working in the creative industries, their future career choices and confidence.

5. Manage, clearly articulate and agree all parties’ expectations of the MA at the outset
The need to effectively manage, clearly articulate and agree all parties’ expectations of the MA at the outset is key to building the foundation for a satisfying and impactful experience for all. Administration of this needs to be kept to a minimum. Expectation management of parties is proposed in three parts:

1. Alignment and agreement of partner host organisations’ expectations, potentially via the proposed **‘Build the Capacity of Your Craft Business’ workshops** proposed in seven. below, and the employer’s expectations in an informal document to be referenced in and appended to the agreement between AAS (employer) and partner host organisations (service providers).
2. Clarification of apprentices’ and the employer’s expectations in an informal document to be appended to and referenced in the employment contract between AAS (employer) and the apprentice (employee).
3. Finally, alignment, clarification and agreement of host organisations’ and apprentices’ expectations in the Apprenticeship Structure detailed in 17. above in **3. Learning to apply to future iterations of AAS’s shared MA programme** (page 41).

6. Create a ‘DRAFT Manual’ as a shared Google / GitHub Doc and crowdsource content from AAS the employer, plus past and future host organisations
To support development of a proposed Manual (detailed in the full version of the Evaluation Report) create a ‘DRAFT Manual’ with existing learning from AAS, apprentices and host organisations in a shared Google / GitHub document and invite past and future host organisations to crowdsource content and editing. AAS should lead editing and review of the Manual to realise a hard copy for reference by host organisations and apprentices.

7. Host ‘Build the Capacity of Your Craft Business’ workshops to inform craft micro businesses and sole traders becoming host organisations in the future shared MA programme
To realise the recommendations, specifically two and three above, and to responsibly deliver the next phase of the shared MA programme AAS should host regular ‘Build the Capacity of Your Craft Business’ workshops (twice a year and in varying geographical locations) at which craft micro businesses and sole traders can establish their business goals and determine the capacity required to achieve them and whether a shared MA is the appropriate to this.

If a shared MA is an appropriate route to build capacity in their business, attendees can consider when it needs to happen and who their potential partner host organisations are, plus speak directly to

AAS as the employer and Apprenticeship Project Manager to establish what is involved and their next steps.

If a shared MA isn't the best route to build capacity in their business, attendees have the basis of a plan to support their research into alternative options including paid internships, subcontracting, collaboration, contracting and employment.

This recommendation optimises AAS's dual position of knowledge and experience of running a shared MA programme and supporting business and professional development of craft micro businesses and sole traders. With regard to the latter, the proposed 'Build the Capacity of Your Craft Business' workshops would provide capacity building training to the craft sector identified in the Craft Scotland Annual Tracking Study 2018 as required to support craft businesses' ambitions for career satisfaction, as per the Study's *'Future Growth'* section:

> *'A key factor in career satisfaction is that 87% of respondents have an ambition to expand their business in the next three years (Question 27). They see that their craft business can grow through upskilling, product development and refining their production capacity. Craft Scotland was keen to investigate what support makers may need to achieve this ambition. The majority (66%) cite entrepreneurial or business skills as an area requiring support, with just over half (51%) seeking support with artistic development/inspiration. Almost half (48%) also cite growing production capacity as something they need support with, this is a key area in running a business in a cost effective and streamlined way.*

Comparing the results of 2018 to 2017, the Study further profiles the craft sector as:

- Having a *'… sharp rise (17%) in using freelance workers in 2018, and a drop of 15% in the use of contracted workers. There is also a small fall in the numbers reported for permanent and fixed-term employees.'*
- The skills respondents felt they needed to help in their business, whether aiming to grow or not are:
    - Entrepreneurial or business skills, 66%
    - Artistic development / inspiration, 51%
    - Production capacity, 48%
    - Other, 21% (e.g. curation, financial, marketing, digital, retail)
- *'Growing my business'* at 67% is the sixth highest factor that contributes to respondents' career satisfaction, behind ability to be creative (90%), learning new approaches and skills (83%), flexible hours (78%), income (74%) and other makers / networks (68%).

8. Research variations of the shared MA model for delivery of the Skills for Craft Business MA in rural locations

Carol Sinclair's initial research **'Mapping Apprenticeships'** (available from AAS on request) considers AAS's variations of the trialled shared MA model for delivery in rural areas and it's alignment with local economic and skills development strategies. Rural areas being considered are Orkney, Angus / Aberdeenshire and South of Scotland (Borders / Dumfries & Galloway) as they have expressed interest in and entered initial conversations about the opportunity.

In line with learning from the Pilot Programme, it is recommended this research explores and proposes:

- How to overcome barriers of time, transport and costs of the apprentices' mobility to attend part-time work with craft micro businesses and sole traders dispersed across large geographical areas.
- Options to fund local part-time Apprenticeship Project Managers time and travel budget.
- Best practice remote delivery of training and assessment by the training provider.

9. Appoint an Apprenticeship Project Manager

An Apprenticeship Project Manager with project management, partnership working experience and importantly skills and experience of working with young people in education, the workplace and with skills development and partnership strategy development would effectively resource AAS to develop a strategic, systematic and sustainable approach to and infrastructure for and delivery of the next phase of the shared MA programme in the craft sector.

In addition to AAS's role and responsibilities listed in **// four // 1 // Summary** (pages 8-9), and in response to learning from the Pilot Programme, the role would:

- Travel to be on hand and present in person to regularly meet with apprentices and host organisations in multiple locations across Scotland, potentially in rural areas going forward, to oversee management of the MAs.
- Provide increased pastoral care for modern apprentices.
- Secure and disseminate the required accessible HR support, advice and expertise to host organisations and apprentices.
- Work closely with training providers to improve their knowledge of micro businesses and sole traders currently practising in the craft sector to provide context for their delivery of training and assessment of the Skills for Craft Business MA.
- Investigate AAS becoming a sector training body for skills and assessment, what would be involved and how it would be resourced to deliver a shared MA programme appropriate for and true to the craft sector, that draws on AAS's network of professional makers.
- Work with partners to develop an apprenticeship strategy for the craft sector, brokering their sustained long-term investment to support it.

As per 13. above in **4. Opportunities for improvement to apply to future iterations of AAS's shared MA programme** (page 43) for delivery of MAs in multiple rural areas across Scotland, this one role could become a series of local part-time Apprenticeship Project Managers.

10. Secure long-term incentive funding

Strategic delivery of the next phase of the shared MA programme requires long-term investment. To achieve impactful outcomes and outputs for host organisations, apprentices and in turn Scotland's craft sector, economic, skills and community development strategies in line with the above recommendations, national and local incentive funding is required from multiple partners working towards an agreed MA strategy for the craft sector and the wider creative industries.

Funds are required for AAS's continued management, administration and delivery of a shared MA programme, plus subsidy of apprentices' wages and would incentivise craft micro businesses and sole traders to host young people in MAs and build capacity in the craft sector. Local incentive funds will not only support the employment and retention of young people but sustain existing micro businesses and sole traders.